



Student Journal of Latin American Studies
The University of Texas at Austin

Issue 2 - 2011

Staff

Editor-in-Chief

Steve Karson

Managing Editor

Nicholas Woodward

Undergraduate Associate Editors

Dylan Clement

Yvonne Cruz

Graduate Associate Editors

Corinna Jay

Allison Ramirez

All at the University of Texas at Austin

SPECIAL THANKS to all the anonymous referees from universities worldwide and the support of the Teresa Lozano Long Institute of Latin American Studies. Without their help this issue would not have been possible.

The Student Journal of Latin American Studies

at The University of Texas at Austin

Issue Two - 2011

The Student Journal of Latin American Studies

Copyright © 2011

All right reserved:

No part of this journal may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording or by any information storage and retrieval system without permission in writing.

Inquiries should be addressed to:

Student Journal of Latin American Studies

Teresa Lozano Long Institute of Latin American Studies

The University of Texas at Austin

1 University Station A6200

Austin, Texas 78712

Issue 2

The Student Journal of Latin American Studies is a registered student organization at the University of Texas at Austin and its views do not necessarily reflect the views of the university.

Printed in the United States of America

A Note from the Editor-in-Chief

It has been two years since the The Student Journal of Latin American Studies (SJofLAS) began with the mission to provide an avenue of publication for quality research about Latin America from both graduate and undergraduate students. As of now, only one member is left from the Journal's original staff. Yet we, the editors, feel that this second edition accomplishes the original mission of SJofLAS in its entirety, and we hope you enjoy the work that follows.

As that last original member, I have witnessed the striking growth of this journal. Not only has the quantity of our submissions increased, but their quality and scope is unprecedented in the short, but significant history of SJofLAS. The articles in this edition come from Brazil, Texas, Florida, and Japan. They cover the disciplines of economics, criminology, journalism, sociology, and architecture. As you will see, we put an emphasis on original ideas no matter what field of research. And it is the interdisciplinary nature of our articles that makes editing this journal a particularly intensive task.

So we thank all the referees, who come from a variety of backgrounds, for their expertise and support. Without them this process would not be possible. We also owe a great deal of thanks to The University of Texas at Austin, The Teresa Lozano Long Institute of Latin American Studies, and the Liberal Arts Honors program. In part due to their efforts, our journal is now included in the University of Texas at Austin's Depository System, which solidifies our position as a first rate student academic journal. This also means that no matter what happens to the staff of this journal, the publications will be archived for future generations as long as the University of Texas stands.

I would also like to acknowledge the work of our new Managing Editor, Nicholas Woodward. His technical knowledge and academic insights have been instrumental in the production of this edition. The future of this journal looks bright with him in charge. Please continue to support both him and our journal with your work.

The goal of academic research is to add to a cumulative body of knowledge for future generations to use. I thank you for participating in this process, and I encourage you to contact the authors or us with constructive comments about the articles. If you are interested in submitting your own article for publication, please look for our next call to submissions. You can find more information about our journal online at www.SJofLAS.org.

On behalf of the Student Journal of Latin American Studies,
Saludos y Buena lectura!

Steven J. Karson

Race, Immigration and Income: The Brazilian Case

Economic Outcomes for Afro-Brazilians in the United States

Mateo Clarke

B.A. in Economics and Latin American Studies 2011

The University of Texas at Austin

Abstract: Since the 1980s, a relatively new phenomenon of Brazilian immigration to North America has emerged. According to the U.S. Census, the number of foreign-born Brazilians in the United States grew from 212,428 in 2000 to 332,632 in 2008. Brazilian government sources place the number of Brazilians in the U.S. as high as 1.1 million. It is widely cited that the initial increase in Brazilian migration revolves around the weakness of the Brazilian economy in the 1980s and 90s. This study assesses the labor market outcomes of black Brazilian immigrants to the United States compared to their white Brazilian immigrant counterparts. It also compares the difference in earnings between these two groups to the differences in earnings between black and white native-born U.S. citizens. Using pooled cross sectional data from the 2000 U.S. Census and the American Community Survey from 2001 to 2008, I examine which race/nativity, demographic, and human capital variables contribute most the economic disparities between blacks and whites born in the U.S. and in Brazil. The results show that Afro-Brazilians do make considerably less on average than their white Brazilian counterparts but the human capital variables account for most of this disparity. It also shows that the difference in earnings between Brazilians of different races is not as wide as that between U.S. American blacks and whites. This is one of the first studies, to my knowledge, which focuses on labor market outcomes for Afro-Brazilians in the U.S. With stronger and more accurate Census data, more conclusions could be made about this growing population.

Introduction

The current age of globalization has seen the transfer of goods, services, and people across traditional nation-state boundaries more than any previous era in human history. As people traverse these national boundaries, they enter into social settings that are defined by national and regional identities, which are influenced by the cultural, historical, and racial legacies of the population. The expanding volume of migrants in the globalized era has significant repercussions on labor markets and consumer behavior both in the communities where migrants settle and the communities that they leave behind.

One migrant category that has seen rapid expansion in the United States since the mid-1980s is from Brazil. This paper will focus on economic outcomes of a specific subgroup of Brazilian migrants, those of African descent who self-identified as black in U.S. Census surveys. Most of the literature on the Brazilian immigrant community is qualitative and primarily focuses on the experiences of white Brazilian immigrants. In large part, this is because the Brazilian population in the U.S. is relatively small and often overlooked since many are undocumented. As one author suggests, “there is a scarcity of reliable information and data about the immigration experience of the Brazilian community” (Siqueira & Lourenço 2006, 186). There are large differences between official and informal estimates of the Brazilian population in the

U.S. It will continue to be a challenge to achieve an exact count of Brazilians as long as the amount of undocumented Brazilians is high.

Unlike the population of Brazil, Brazilian communities in the U.S. tend to be “weighted towards the lighter end of the color spectrum” (Margolis 2009, 99). The issue of race and income inequality in Brazil and the U.S. has similar outcomes. Blacks make up 45 percent of the total Brazilian population, but they compose of 64 percent of people living below the poverty line (Htun 2004). In the U.S., blacks make up about 13 percent of the total population and have a poverty rate of 25.8 compared to 9.4 percent for non-Hispanic whites (U.S. Census Bureau 2009, 16). It is unclear whether these inequalities are a product of racial and ethnic discrimination or blacks’ lower returns from and disadvantaged access to human capital (Dodoo & Takyi 2002). The purpose of this paper is to compare the earnings of Afro-Brazilians to their white Brazilian immigrant counterparts. Additionally, I address whether the relative black-white gap in income is as large between Brazilian immigrants as it is for U.S. natives.

Background

Historically, Brazil has been a society that receives immigrants and has not been a sending nation, especially in the period from 1872 to 1972 (de Brito Fabri Demartini 2006). This trend has changed in the past 20-30 years. According to the U.S. Census, the number of foreign-born Brazilians in the United States grew from 212,428 in 2000 to 332,632 in 2008. The Brazilian Foreign Ministry places the number of Brazilians overseas at more than 1.5 million, of which, around 1.1 million living in the U.S. (Siqueira and Lourenço 2006, 189). One reason for the discrepancy in these counts is that roughly 70 percent of Brazilian immigrants are undocumented, with many either overstaying their tourist visa or coming illegally through Mexico (Meihy 2004). In fact, in 2005 Brazilians became the largest group of undocumented immigrants “other than Mexican,” OTM, detained crossing the border illegally by U.S. border enforcement (Rohter 2005).

Brazilians often describe their situation as “economic immigrants” (Margolis 1995). Inflation, currency reform, and unemployment in Brazil caused instability in labor markets throughout the 1990s and early 2000s, a period known as the “lost decade” in Brazil. Compared to other Latin American migrants, especially those from Mexico and Central America, Brazilian immigrants come to the U.S. with higher education and skill levels and higher socioeconomic status (Portes & Rumbaut 2006; Margolis 1995). They are mostly members of the Brazilian middle class who come to the U.S. to make more money performing lower status occupations than they could in Brazil in higher status occupations. Economic instability is seen as a push factor while the increasingly robust network of Brazilian migrants in the U.S. provides incentives that make the transition from one’s local community to a foreign one more manageable.

The most robust migrant networks and Brazilian communities are found in the New York and Boston metropolitan regions and are the focus of most scholarly study (Margolis 2009; Martes 2000; Siqueira and Lourenço 2006; Meihy 2004). More recent studies examine new destinations in the Southern United States for Brazilian migration including New Orleans and Florida (Domingues-Resende 2009; Fussel 2009; Gibson 2008).

Issues of race and ethnicity are complicated for Brazilian migrants. They come from a society proclaiming the virtue of a “racial democracy” (Freyre 1933). Brazil is a country where inter-racial relationships are commonplace and its society is based on a racial “continuum” which is supposedly beyond racial discrimination. However, the American experience is traditionally a binary system of segregation where black is black and white is white. The so-

called “one-drop-of-blood rule” has historically served as means polarizing race in the U.S. In Brazil the reverse is true where one-drop of European ancestry makes one “potentially white” (Marrow 2003). Brazilians who come to the United States may have never considered themselves as black in Brazil, but they “become black” and are racialized by the norms of U.S. society (Ramos-Zayas 2007). Unawareness by U.S. citizens of cultural, geographical and historical backgrounds of different Latin American countries often leads to the classification of Brazilians based on the dominant U.S. ethno-racial categories (i.e. Hispanic or Latino). However, few Brazilians considered themselves to be Hispanic/Latino because they neither share Hispanic origin nor the Spanish language (Travassos & Williams 2004).

The questions my study attempts to answer are, do Afro-Brazilians earn less on average than their white Brazilian counterparts? What variables account for a difference in earnings? Is the difference in earnings between black and white Brazilians on average smaller or larger than the disparity between African-Americans and white U.S. Americans? I hypothesize that although Afro-Brazilian immigrants earn less than their white Brazilian counterparts, the relative difference in earnings between them is not as large as it is for black U.S. Americans compared to white U.S. Americans. The prediction that Afro-Brazilians will make more than white Brazilians is consistent with the reality in Brazil. The prediction that earnings gaps for migrants of different races is not as large as the gap between U.S. natives of different races is based on the assumption that immigrants across the board experience disadvantages in the labor market, especially those with undocumented status.

My research is unique because most of the studies I have encountered are qualitative and are not based on nationally representative data sources. No quantitative study I have encountered focuses on issues of race and income within the Brazilian immigrant community. By studying the labor market experiences of black migrants, my hope is to discover the implications of race in the supposedly “post-racial” societies of the United States and Brazil.

Data and Measurements

The data for this study come from the 5 percent Integrated Public Use Microsamples (IPUMS) of the 2000 Census of Population and the American Community Survey Sample (ACS) from the years 2001 through 2008 (Ruggles et al., 2010). I pooled nine years of cross sectional to obtain as many Afro-Brazilians samples as possible for the purpose of my analysis. Birth in Brazil and birth in the United States was the first selection criteria. From the 2000 Census 5 percent sample, only Brazilians were selected and only U.S. natives who self-reported as black or white were selected. Only Brazilians who self-reported as non-Hispanic black or non-Hispanic white remained in the final sample.¹ From the original sample of U.S. natives in the 2000 Census, a random sample of 10 percent of whites and a random sample of 25 percent of blacks was kept. From the ACS samples, a random sample of 20 percent of U.S. natives was kept from each survey year (2001 to 2008) for the final sample. No modifications were made to the Brazilian born population. All changes were made to ensure efficiency while analyzing the data in the statistical software known as Stata, which has memory limitations. The following selection criteria were placed on all remaining individuals. The sample selection is restricted to non-institutionalized working age males and females who reported positive earnings in the survey year. For the purposes of this paper “working age” is defined as between the ages of 25, when all educational attainment can assumed to be complete, and 62 when the retirement process

¹ There were 17 Afro-Brazilians who self-reported Hispanic. This illustrates the ambiguity of ethno-racial terms and for consistency across birthplace variables, these individuals were left out of the final sample.

begins. By appending data from the 2000 U.S. Census with the ACS from 2001 to 2008, I was able to identify 323 Afro-Brazilians of working age. My analysis focuses on the 258 Afro-Brazilians whose data was not missing for my variable requirements². After these restrictions were imposed, my analytic sample contains 258 black and 9,867 white Brazilians. The analytic sample contains 261,667 non-Hispanic black and 1,538,796 non-Hispanic white U.S. natives. Table 1 shows the descriptive statistics for the final sample stratified by country of origin (Brazil vs. U.S.).

[See Table 1]

Measures

The dependent variable is logged income. Income was logged in order to normalize the distribution, which was highly skewed to the left. Persons reporting an annual income of less than or equal to zero were eliminated from the analytical sample.³ Income was adjusted for inflation using the Consumer Price Index (CPI) and the base year is 2008.⁴

As shown in Table 1, the independent variables are as follows:

Age is a continuous variable calculated in years (range 25-62). Female is a dichotomous variable where 1=female and 0=male. Married is a dichotomous variable where 1=married and 0=not married. The third and final block of variables measures human and social capital. Good English is a dichotomous variable simplified from the categorical variable English proficiency. Those who do not speak English or who speak English but not well=0. Those who speak English well, very well, or only speak English=1. Good English is included as a human/social capital variable because English Proficiency and is a tool which enables higher skill levels of work. Years in the U.S. is a continuous variable. Years in the U.S. is considered a social capital variable because I assume the longer an individual is in the country, the more established he/she is in their community and is more aware of opportunities for social mobility. Education is my measure of human capital. I categorized a continuous measure of education as follows: Less than High School (LTHS, Grade 0 to Grade 11), High School (HS, Grade 12 and GED), Some College (SC, Grades above 12 and below Bachelor's degree), College and Higher (Completion of Bachelor's degree and any additional professional or doctoral degree). For each of the four educational categories, a dummy variable was generated. All four categories are mutually exclusive. These categories approximate the credentials commonly found in the U.S. educational system. Here it is worth noting that the structure for schooling in Brazil matches the United States for the purposes of this study. In Brazil, grades 1 through 9 are considered fundamental education and are mandatory for students from ages 6-14. The next three years of schooling are called Middle Education including grades 10 through 12, roughly corresponding to

² This excludes those Afro-Brazilians who earned negative or no income in the year of the survey.

³ This eliminated 2,053 Brazilians and 265,780 U.S. natives from the sample. We will assume that those that had no income or negative income are not labor market participants and therefore irrelevant to this particular topic. This may include people who are dependent on a spouse's income (e.g. a housewife).

⁴ Data for CPI can be found on the Bureau for Labor Statistics website (<ftp://ftp.bls.gov/pub/special.requests/cpi/cpiiai.txt>, Last Accessed: May 16, 2011).

The calculation is as follows:

Adjusted income = CPI of base year / CPI of given year * income of given year
(e.g. Adjusted income for 2000 = 215.303/172.200 * income in 2000)

U.S. High School. Brazilian Middle Education is free but not mandatory. In this study, the completion of Middle Education in Brazil is equivalent to the completion of High School in the U.S., both concluding with 12 years of education.

Methods

In my analysis, I utilize OLS regression and estimate separate models for persons born in the United States and persons born in Brazil. I chose to take a nested approach to my models so that blocks of variables could be introduced and tested for statistical significance and robustness. There are three models for each birthplace stratum, six models in total. Model 1 examines the net effect of race without controls. Non-Hispanic black is used in the model while non-Hispanic white is the reference variable. The second model builds on Model 1 and introduces the basic demographic characteristics to evaluate the association between race and income net of the controls for age, gender, and marital status. Model 3 builds off the first two models and introduces controls for human/social capital with the variables measuring English proficiency, years in the U.S., and a categorical measure of education with college and higher as the reference category. The models within each stratum are as follows:

Model 1: $\log \text{ income} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 \text{ non-Hispanic Black} + \varepsilon_i$

Model 2: $\log \text{ income} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 \text{ non-Hispanic Black} + \beta_2 \text{ Age} + \beta_3 \text{ Female} + \beta_4 \text{ Married} + \varepsilon_i$

Model 3: $\log \text{ income} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 \text{ non-Hispanic Black} + \beta_2 \text{ Age} + \beta_3 \text{ Female} + \beta_4 \text{ Married}$
 $+ \beta_5 \text{ Good English} + \beta_6 \text{ Yrs in U.S.} + \beta_7 \text{ LTHS} + \beta_8 \text{ HS} + \beta_9 \text{ SC} + \varepsilon_i$

[See Table 2]

Results

By performing an exponentiation of the coefficient for each independent variable as related to the outcome variable, logged income, I was able to calculate a percentage representing the percent difference between each variable and its reference category (in the case of dichotomous variables) or percent difference for each unit added or subtracted (in the case of continuous variables).⁵ The first model from the strata for Brazilian immigrants shows the net effect of race without any other controls. The first model suggests that Afro-Brazilians earn on average 18.7% less than their white Brazilian counterparts.

When the basic demographic variables were included in Model 2, there was an unexpected increase in income disparity. I expected demographic variables to explain away the income disparity attributed to race, so to determine the source of this fluctuation, I ran additional models that further stratified the Brazilian sample by gender. In these models I found that the small fluctuation was due to much lower earnings by Brazilian women than men. I inspected the 95 percent confidence intervals between men and women and although the average log income was substantially lower for women, the intervals overlapped and the conclusion for the model remains the same. When I ran the model only for men, the coefficients for non-Hispanic blacks decreased in Model 2 & 3 as expected, similar to the models for U.S. born. With that being said, Model 2 suggests that Afro-Brazilians make 19.2% less than white Brazilians net of age, gender, and marital status. For each year increase in age, the model suggests a 1.13% increase in income

⁵ The calculation is as follows:

$\% = [e^{(\text{coefficient in logged form})} - 1] * 100$

on average. It also suggests that a Brazilian born female's income is 48% less than male Brazilians on average. The coefficient for the marital status variable is insignificant in both Models 2 and 3.

When human and social capital variables are included in Model 3, the race variable loses statistical significance. This happens while differences in education explain away the race coefficient. Model 3 suggests that Afro-Brazilians make 10% less than white Brazilians on average, net of the other variables included in the model. For each year increase in age, Model 3 suggests less than half percent increase in income. The model suggests that women make 50% less than men on average among Brazilians in the U.S. on average. An immigrant that speaks English well earns 23% on average more than one who does not speak English well. An individual will earn on average 1% more each year spent in the U.S. According to Model 3, a Brazilian immigrant who has not completed high school earns on average 47% less than one who has completed college. A Brazilian that has finished high school earns on average 42% less than one with a college degree, and finally, an individual who has completed some college earns on average 32% less than one who has a Bachelor's degree or higher. The results of these three models suggest that my first hypothesis, that Afro-Brazilians make significantly less than white Brazilians, is correct. This difference can be attributed to discrepancy in human capital as shown in Model 3.

Consistent with my hypothesis that racial income discrepancy is more severe for U.S. natives, the strata for those born in the U.S. shows that income disparities gaps is larger for U.S. natives than Brazilian immigrants. The first model suggests that non-Hispanic black U.S. natives earn on average 32% less than their non-Hispanic white counterparts in total effect. Model 2 suggests that blacks earn on average 25% less than whites net of the demographic variables included in the model. For each added year in age, a U.S. born worker earns less than half a percent on average. Females earn 42% less than U.S. males on average and those who are married earn 24% more than those unmarried in this model. In Model 3, the race variable is explained away even more, as it was for the Brazilian strata. In this model, blacks earn on average 17% less than whites net of the demographic variables and human capital variables included in the model. For each added year in age, a U.S. born worker earns just over half a percent on average. Females earn 44% less than U.S. males on average and those who are married earn 15% more than those unmarried in this model. According to Model 3, an individual who has not completed high school earns on average 71% less than one who has completed college. A U.S. native that has finished high school earns on average 50% less than one with a college degree, and finally, an individual who has completed some college earns on average 36% less than one who has a Bachelor's degree or higher net of all the other variables in the model.

The results of these three models controlled for U.S. birthplace show that blacks earn significantly less on average than whites. When I compare the coefficients for the race variable across the two strata, I find that U.S. native blacks are at more of a disadvantage compared to their white counterparts than Afro-Brazilians are to white Brazilians (17% to 10% difference in earnings respectively). This finding supports my second hypothesis that the earnings gap between black and white Brazilian migrants is not as large as the gap between black and white U.S. natives.

Conclusion

In this paper, I examined the labor market experiences of Afro-Brazilians compared to their white Brazilian compatriots in the U.S. I also compared earnings gaps between these two

groups of Brazilian immigrants with the earnings gap between black and white U.S. Americans. In summary, through my analysis I was able to find that the income disparity for Afro-Brazilians can be accounted for almost completely by lower levels of human capital. This explains some, but not all, of the discrepancy between blacks and whites born in the U.S. I also found that the black-white income gap is larger for U.S. citizens than for Brazilian born immigrants. These findings imply that even though Brazilians may interact more with their black compatriots in the U.S. than they do in Brazil (Ehrlich 1989), there does still exist income disparities that may be attributed to differences in education, English proficiency, and years in the U.S. It is true that within the Brazilian educational system, human capital is less accessible on average for Brazilians of African heritage than white Brazilians.

Most of the immigrants in my sample were likely educated in Brazil before immigrating to the United States. With that in mind, my theory is that racial inequalities in the Brazilian educational system migrate to the U.S. labor market with Brazilians as they make the decision to immigrate. We see these inequalities in the form of lower wages for Afro-Brazilians in the U.S. labor market. The key result of the U.S. Models gives us room to speculate that lack of access to human capital may not be the only story. Though the race variable is not significant in the third model of the Brazil strata that includes human capital variables, there is statistical significance for the race variable in Model 3 of the U.S. strata. This suggests to me that, as U.S. blacks are sometimes victims to discrimination in the U.S. labor markets, so too could Afro-Brazilians be discriminated against based on skin color. Immigration status could also contribute to discrimination, however data on this topic is scarce. Importantly, to my knowledge, this analysis is among the first to focus specifically on the experiences of Afro-Brazilian immigrants in the United States using nationally representative data. Some authors address the racial issues between Brazilian migrants but all previous work that I found relied on personal observations and anecdotal information as opposed to empirical evidence.

There are several limitations to my work. First, the most obvious limitation is the small size of my sample. There simply are not enough Afro-Brazilians counted in Census data for a large sample to be analyzed. I was further limited when placing restrictions to include only Afro-Brazilians of working age. The literature on immigrant labor market outcomes often limits the analysis only to men, since they are more likely to work than immigrant women; however, I chose not to restrict my model to men because doing so would further reduce the size of my analytic sample. Additionally, the models include a limited number of controls. For example, one variable I would have liked to include in my model is immigration status or type of visa possessed. These are sensitive questions for an immigrant to respond truthfully on an official survey. Another limitation was the variations in ethno-racial standards for U.S. and Brazilian society. As racial mixing is common in Brazilian society, many “Afro-Brazilians” may have been left out who reported more than one race (e.g. black & white). Future studies would benefit by including these mixed race Brazilians. Even still, the reliability of self-reported race is unverifiable and could produce misleading results. My decision to use a categorical variable for education is based on the assumption that credentials (degrees and diplomas) are more valuable signals to employers than a quantitative measure for accumulated years of schooling. Using a quantitative measure of education in place of my categories, LTHS, HS, SC, and CH would test this assumption.

Furthermore, this approach could be more appropriate given the reforms that have occurred over the past decade in the standard schooling structure in Brazil relative to the U.S. Finally, comparing between groups as opposed to doing a formal statistical test between

Brazilians and U.S. citizens limits the robustness of my results. Though not a limitation for the purposes of my study, we must keep in mind that this study is strictly focused on the U.S. American labor market, and can say little about labor market outcomes in Brazil. The sample of Brazilians in the U.S. is not a representative cross-section of the native population in Brazil. This is particularly true for the subgroup of Afro-Brazilians. Literature on immigrant selectivity suggests that immigrants are not representative random samples of their host country population and that in most cases they do have higher levels of education, but this and other factors depends on country specifics (Feliciano 2005). Future studies could compare my results on the U.S. labor market to studies on Brazilian labor market using Brazilian Census data to determine how Afro-Brazilian labor outcomes vary in Brazil and the exterior.

Acknowledgements: I gratefully acknowledge the resources provided by Research Experience for Undergraduates (REU) program at the University of Texas at Austin, funded by the National Science Foundation under Grant No. SMA-1004809. I would especially like to acknowledge Dr. Nestor Rodriguez and Dr. Rebecca Torres who instructed our course on Immigration in the U.S. and who directed the program. I would like to thank Mrs. Jennifer Montez for her instruction and crash course on STATA. I would like to thank all the fine staff at the Population Research Center. Finally, I would like to thank Mr. Dustin Brown, my graduate student mentor who showed his generous patience as this project developed.

References:

- Brito Fabri Demartini, Zeila de
2006 "Immigration in Brazil." *Journal of Immigrant & Refugee Studies* 4 (2): 69-95.
- Dodoo, FNA, and BK Takyi
2002 "Africans in the Diaspora: Black-White Earnings Differences among America's Africans." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 25 (6): 913-941.
- Domingues-Resende, Rosana
2009 "Tropical Brazucas: Brazilians in South Florida and the Imaginary of National Identity." Dissertation, University of Florida.
- Ehrlich, Claudia
1989 Beyond Black and White: A Perspective on Racial Attitudes of Paulistas in São Paulo and New York. Senior Project, Bard College.
- Feliciano, Cynthia
2005 "Educational Selectivity in U.S. Immigration: How Do Immigrants Compare to Those Left behind?" *Demography* 42 (1): 131-152.
- Freyre, Gilberto
1933 *The Master and the Slaves*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, Print.
- Fussell, Elizabeth
2009 "Hurricane Chasers in New Orleans: Latino Immigrants as a Source of a Rapid Response Labor Force." *Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences* 31 (3): 375-394.
- Gibson, Annie McNeill
2008 "Brazuca in NOLA: A Cultural Analysis of Brazilian Immigration to New Orleans Post-Katrina." *Studies in Latin American Popular Culture* (27): 103-128.

Htun, Mala

2004 "From 'Racial Democracy' to Affirmative Action: Changing State Policy on Race in Brazil." *Latin American Research Review* 39 (1): 60-89.

Margolis, Maxine L.

1995 "Transnationalism and Popular Culture: The Case of Brazilian Immigrants in the United States." *The Journal of Popular Culture* 29 (1): 29-42.

2009 *An Invisible Minority: Brazilians in New York City*. Revised & expanded ed. Gainesville, FL: University Press of Florida.

Marrow, Helen

2003 "To be or not to be (Hispanic or Latino): Brazilian Racial and Ethnic Identity in the United States." *Ethnicities* 3 (4): 427-464.

Martes, Ana Cristina Braga

2000 *Brasileiros nos Estados Unidos: Um estudo sobre imigrantes em Massachusetts (Portuguese Edition)*. Rio de Janeiro: Paz e Terra.

Meihy, J. C. S. B.

2004 *Brasil fora de si: Experiências de Brasileiros em Nova Iorque*. São Paulo, Brazil: Parábola Editorial.

Portes, Alejandro and Ruben Rumbaut

2006 *Immigrant America: A Portrait*. 3rd Edition. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Ramos-Zayasa, Ana Y.

2007 "Becoming American, Becoming Black? Urban Competency, Racialized Spaces, and the Politics of Citizenship Among Brazilian and Puerto Rican Youth in Newark." *Identities* 14 (1): 85-109.

Rohter, Larry

2005 "Brazilians Streaming Into U.S. Through Mexican Border." *New York Times*. N.p., 30 June 2005. Web. 1 July 2010.
<<http://www.nytimes.com/2005/06/30/international/americas/30brazil.html?pagewanted=print>>.

Ruggles, Steven, J. Trent Alexander, Katie Genadek, Ronald Goeken, Matthew B. Schroeder, and Matthew Sobek.

2010 *Integrated Public Use Microdata Series: Version 5.0* [Machine-readable database]. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota.

Siqueira, Carlos Eduardo and Cileine de Lourenço

2006 "Brazilians in Massachusetts: Migration, Identity, and Work." *Latinos in New England*. Pp. 187-202. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

Siqueira, Carlos Eduardo and Tiago Jansen

2008 "Updating Demographic, Geographic, and Occupational Data on Brazilians in Massachusetts." *Becoming Brazuca: Brazilian Immigration to the United States (David Rockefeller Center Series on Latin American Studies)*. Pp. 105-124. Cambridge, MA: David Rockefeller Center for Latin American Studies.

Travassos, Claudia and David R. Williams

2004 The Concept and Measurement of Race and Their Relationship to Public Health: A Review Focused on Brazil and the United States. *Cadernos de Saude Publica* 20 (3): 660-678.

U.S. Census Bureau

2009 *Income, Poverty, and Health Insurance Coverage in the United States*.
 Pp. 60-236. Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Commerce Economics and
 Statistics Administration

Table 1: Descriptive statistics for the sample by birthplace*

	Born Brazil		Born U.S.	
	<u>n</u>	<u>%</u>	<u>n</u>	<u>%</u>
Race				
Black	258	2.5%	261,677	13.8%
White	9,867	92.7%	1,538,796	82.8%
Age (mean)	39.1	-	43.3	-
Female	5,274	47.4%	899,426	48.6%
Married	7,231	63.0%	1,184,594	61.3%
Good English	8,816	74.9%	1,833,456	99.8%
Years in the U.S. (mean)	12.4	-	-	-
Education (mean)	13.4	-	13.5	-
Less than High School	1,028	10.8%	120,257	7.0%
High School	3,480	36.3%	703,475	36.9%
Some College	1,954	17.7%	479,432	26.3%
College and Higher	4,321	35.2%	534,421	29.8%
Income (mean)	\$ 42,401.00	-	\$ 47,598.25	-
Logged Income (mean)	10.2	-	10.3	-

Notes: Income is adjusted to 2008 dollar amounts based on CPI adjustment

Table 2: OLS Regression Coefficients for Logged Income Stratified by Birthplace

	Brazilian Immigrants			U.S. Born		
	Model 1	Model 2	Model 3	Model 1	Model 2	Model 3
<u>Race</u>						
Black	-0.21*	-0.21*	-0.10	-0.38**	-0.29**	-0.19**
<u>Demographics</u>						
Age	-	0.01**	0.00**	-	0.00**	0.01**
Female	-	-0.66**	-0.70**	-	-0.55**	-0.58**
Married	-	0.02	-0.01	-	0.21**	0.14**
<u>Human Capital</u>						
Good English	-	-	0.21**	-	-	0.18**
Years in U.S.	-	-	0.01**	-	-	-
Less than HS	-	-	-0.64**	-	-	-1.23**
High School	-	-	-0.55**	-	-	-0.70**
Some College	-	-	-0.38**	-	-	-0.44**
Constant	10.23	10.10	10.41	10.38	10.33	10.58
R-squared	0.001	0.089	0.167	0.014	0.085	0.177
N	10,783	10,783	10,783	1,837,585	1,837,585	1,837,585

*p<.01, **p<.001

Notes: The models focus strictly on non-Hispanic blacks and whites. The reference category are as follows: non-Hispanic whites, males, unmarried, poor English, college or higher

The Born Criminal in the Coffee Metropolis: The Ideas of Lombroso in São Paulo and Latin America in the Late Nineteenth Century

Marcelo Thadeu Quintanilha Martins
B.A. Candidate in History
Universidade de São Paulo

Abstract: This article examines the penetration of the ideas of the Italian physician Cesare Lombroso (1835-1909) in the city of São Paulo, known then as the Coffee Metropolis. In 1889, Brazil became a federalist Republic with an economy based on the export of coffee. The coffee planters in the state of São Paulo, especially those who controlled the state and made the presidents of the country, aimed to transform the city of São Paulo into a modern capital with modern institutions. It was at this moment that the ideas of “social defense” propagated by Lombroso appeared in the discourses of lawyers and police delegates with the objective of securing order in a society whose population was increasing due to a wave of immigration from Europe.

Introduction

People walked the streets near the Luz railway station without worrying about the thin man, poorly dressed and barefoot, beside a kiosk. On Sundays, the station was packed with travelers and people enjoying the park. It was a morning like any other in São Paulo, that is until the barefoot man took a knife from his waist and stabbed a passerby in the heart. Two young men near the victim were paralyzed by the scene. The mad man, who looked like a beggar, stared at them and went up to the two of them with the knife in his hand. One of the onlookers, César Ventura, stumbled away, and was stabbed in the back. He died in the arms of a woman who held him while he bled to death. A desperate vendor blew a whistle. The killer ran toward him, forcing the vendor to lock himself in the kiosk. The screams attracted three uniformed policemen. The offender seriously wounded them and fled, stabbing more people along the way. Even after being shot, he managed to hide in a bush far from the station. Surrounded by several police officers, he surrendered. It happened in the morning of October 18, 1896 (Correio Paulistano October 19, 1896).

The assailant's name was Miguel de Sant'Anna Leão, a newspeddler and tram cleaner. He was illiterate and unemployed. He had lived some time in Santos, where he was arrested for loitering more than once. While in prison there he suffered serious injuries after being beaten by a soldier. He arrived in São Paulo with few resources. And after being evicted, he turned to the streets of São Paulo. When asked why he had committed those crimes, his response was that he didn't remember. The police delegate took him to the morgue and showed him the bodies of the victims. Leão insisted that he did not remember what happened (Correio Paulistano October 20, 1896).

In the police report, the delegate described Miguel Sant'Anna Leão in detail: elusive temple, facial asymmetry of the left cheek, left eyebrow arch below the standard level, a slight depression on the left side of the nose, ears looking like wings irregularly positioned, with the left ear below the level of the right, concave curved nose, mouth straight and regular, full lips,

brown eyes and light brown hair. He was described as having a tough look with a little gentle beard, dilated nostrils and developed muscle strength. For these characteristics, the police delegate concluded that the defendant was "a precious example of those epileptoids who anthropologists termed the moral insane - which melts and blends with the born criminal of Lombroso" (ATJSP 1896). The newspapers reprinted the full report from the police delegate Antônio Godoy Moreira Costa, a newly formed law graduate, poet and member of a traditional family in São Paulo.

The position of delegate was only for Bachelors in Law indicated personally by the police chief. It was a position occupied by people in whom the governor had absolute confidence. The police delegate had the power to arrest, accuse suspects, report crimes, make searches and enter residences without a judicial order. His functions were similar to those of an instructing magistrate, the French *juge d'instruction*; however, he was a police official, subordinate to the executive power, and theoretically controlled by the judicial power. A subaltern policeman, often illiterate, one could never ascend to the position of delegate. Subaltern police officers and delegates belonged to different classes, meant to occupy hierarchically distinct positions. The system reflected Brazilian society and served to reinforce existing social barriers (Bueno 1910, 45-47; Sadek 2003).

The delegate pressed upon the press his own impressions of Leão, pointing out other features of the killer. Among them, his indifference when hearing of the terrible things he had been prosecuted for; his insensitivity to pain (he had been shot; yet, continued to resist until he was captured); his "monkey" agility; and previous arrests for vagrancy. "As you know," said the delegate, "the inveterate sloth is one of the characteristics of the moral insane. [Miguel de Sant'Anna Leão] is a curious kind that deserves to be studied", concluded the police authority. The newspaper also mentioned that when the delegate approached him, Leão greeted him with respect and reverence. Leão was polite with everyone in the precinct, extremely humble and thoughtful. He smiled, and did not demonstrate remorse. The only thing that bothered him was the bullet lodged in his body, which he insisted on trying to take out with his nail (Correio Paulistano October 25, 1896).

The studies of Italian physician Cesare Lombroso (1835-1909), famous for "discovering" the born criminal characteristics, made their way to Brazil through academic discussion; yet, these studies were mainly known by the public through the press. In the second half of the nineteenth century, articles citing Comte, Darwin, Spencer and Lombroso in São Paulo newspapers were common. It was a time of great admiration for the idea of progress and adherence to the strict laws of modern science. Three years before Miguel de Sant'Anna Leão's aforementioned attack, the district attorney Cândido Nanzianzeno Nogueira da Motta (1873-1941) demonstrated his worries about the São Paulo's rising crime rate in the opening of his report to the State Attorney General, emphasizing:

"The criminal is not, as it might seem, an individual acting with the impulses of his own desires: the evil which he inevitably tends to, so to speak, is the atmosphere in which he lives, the air that he breathes, the food that stimulates him and comforts him in his normal state, finally. (...)

The inability to prevent its manifestation, however, does not allow the inaction of state power, responsible for providing welfare and public peace, and remove the causes of their disturbances, [which] as much as the offense itself ... [is a] product of different actors

and various causes like certain diseases deemed incurable, [and] can be modified in the sense of a relief to the social order (...). Although, to be effective, it is necessary that the state action does not waste its forces in useless combat.” (DGP 1894, 27)

A passionate disciple of Lombroso, Motta sought an effective treatment for the crime problem in São Paulo as if he dealing with a pathology. He advocated the end of the popular jury, criticized existing laws and lamented the lack of preparation of the police. Cândido Motta lived in a town that grew at an accelerated pace. In 1893, the census of the newly created Bureau of Statistics reported that the city reached 130,775 inhabitants, doubling its population in just three years. In 1900, São Paulo had more than 240,000 inhabitants. More than half of them were foreigners, mostly Italians, brought to serve as a cheap labor in the coffee plantations, the nation's major source of wealth (Love 1982). The report described the harsh living conditions of the tenements where most of the immigrants lived where health epidemics occurred (APESP 1894, 65-75).

São Paulo, capital of the richest state in the nation, was being rebuilt to mirror to the entrepreneurial character of its ruling class. But the abundant presence of so many unemployed in the city brought previously unknown problems to its officials. The number of people looking for work far exceeded the needs of the market, which kept wages at extremely low levels, multiplying poverty and misery. The high immigration level, responsible for forming an abundance of cheap labor, favored the large landowners while disfavoring those who had nothing more than their labor power to sell (Pinto 1994). In 1892, a newspaper noted that beggars were almost all foreigners who did not find the opportunities they had come for (Morse 1970, 242).

Nationwide, the situation was also unsettling. Since the Monarchy had been replaced by the Republic in 1889, an environment of uncertainty had gripped the country. The first decade of the republican regime was marked by coups, rebellions and a civil war. In 1893, a military intervention in the state of Rio Grande do Sul and a revolt in the navy occurred almost simultaneously. The conflicts were solved only in 1898, during the mandate of President Campos Salles, who promoted an arrangement between the central government and regional leaders. Manuel Ferraz de Campos Salles (1841-1913) was the son of a rich coffee grower and one of those who would be most interested in promoting internal peace. Without stability, there would be no possibility of resolving the financial chaos and negotiating the foreign debt with the British banks. Without a solution to this financial crisis, the credit that moved the state economy would disappear (Lessa 1988; Schulz 1996).

Given this situation, São Paulo's elite was determined to restore order in the country and make the city of São Paulo, the dynamic center of the coffee economy, an example (Love 1982). Cândido Motta was one of many young university graduates who engaged themselves in this task. He was 23 and was from the small town of Porto Feliz. Despite belonging to a traditional family, Cândido Motta was poor, which meant he had no land, only a diploma. In 1888, he joined the São Francisco School of Law in São Paulo, from which he graduated in 1891. The following year he was appointed district attorney by Governor Bernardino de Campos (1841-1915). Cândido Motta was an exalted anti-monarchist in his student years, visiting often the Republican Club on São Bento Street and the law firm of Bernardino and Campos Salles (the future president) on Quinze de Novembro Street (Motta Filho 1972, 77; DGP 1942, 502).

He became, in his own words, a sort of secretary for Bernardino, who "saw in him something useful" (Motta Filho 1941, 7). After graduation, Bernardino de Campos nominated him as the public attorney in the interior of the state. The following year, Bernardino created new

positions in the public administration and brought back Cândido Motta to the capital. At that time, he was already a follower of Lombroso. Cândido Motta was an autodidact like other members of his generation, as the School of Law remained conservative and wedded to the old classics of law (Adorno 1988, 103). In his first report, issued in 1893, the young attorney had the opportunity to express his beliefs:

"The judicial organization procedure laws require serious alterations or complete replacement by others that are better suited to the demands of science and the very special conditions of the courts of this capital, which served as a field for our observations. Responsible for supervising the distribution of justice and monitor the progress of the courts of law, we consider it our duty to denounce the errors, irregularities, inconsistencies and the vices of it, pointing out its main causes, and for those who think that we should not demolish it without having means of creating, state remedies and reforms that we consider suitable for curing the illness and removing the difficulties." (DGP 1894, 27)

Cândido Motta began his criticism by recalling a case in which he had served, that of the Italian Angelo Parizzi, who was arrested on charges of raping and murdering a fourteen-year old boy. The boy's body was found in the river Tamanduateí. Police agents, called by the population "secrets" because they mixed in the crowd without a uniform, presented two witnesses to the crime - two children who reported seeing Parizzi with the victim. The judge was not convinced by the evidence and freed the Italian. The attorney appealed the verdict, but the child witnesses told the judge, in front of the jury, that they were forced by the "secrets" to provide testimony accusing Parizzi. Thus, the jury acquitted the defendant (DGP 1894, 29).

As prosecutor, Motta was unhappy with the outcome of the case. In his point of view, the "secrets" hindered more than helped justice. In the absence of witnesses or because they were too lazy to look for them, these agents forged testimony to please the police delegates, wrote the attorney (DGP 1894, 30). The police proved to be incapable of gathering evidence or conducting a regular investigation, undermining the whole process and increasing mistrust in the justice system. Confronted with this, he proposed a solution: the adoption of Lombroso's methods to diagnose the nature of the criminal suspect and thus compensate for the lack of evidence (DGP 1894, 36). Lombroso suggested that it was possible to detect criminals with a single glance. A close examination of the physical characteristics of an individual was enough to confirm their guilt, and determine their criminal tendencies (Gould 1999, 135-139; Horn 2003). His disciple, Enrico Ferri (1856-1929), explained, for example, how easy it was to distinguish murderers from non-violent thieves. The first had a crude and square jaw, quite frequent in natural killers, according to this perspective, as well as prominent cheek bones, an elusive or narrow temple and small glassy eyes; while pickpockets had slender jaws and shifty eyes (Ferri 2003, 233).

Cândido Motta was confident that a study similar to that of Lombroso would solve the problem of evidence. Excited, the prosecutor threw himself into an effort to catalog the criminal types living in São Paulo, adapting the classification created by Ferri and Lombroso (Motta 1925). This was at the same time that the newspapers reported the crimes of Miguel de Sant'Anna Leão. Shortly after the crimes, Cândido Motta studied Leão in jail. The attorney was a personal friend of the police delegate Antônio de Godoy, who visited his house and shared his admiration for Lombroso (Motta Filho 1972, 256).

Calmer while in jail, Leão said he attacked those people because they made “terrible faces” at him. A careful analysis of his testimony gives us a clue about what may have happened that Sunday. Miguel Sant’Anna Leão presented evidence of what psychiatry classifies today as paranoia, that is, he suffered from the feeling of being persecuted and at risk of being attacked at any moment. In such cases, one kills out of fear, not out of savagery. The medical literature includes reports of similar crimes to those of Leão (Palomba 1996, 30-49; Ross 1998, 178-186; Oltmanns et al. 1999, 138-152; Josef 2000, 49-51). Paranoia is controlled with medication, but in the late nineteenth century there was neither medicine nor even a proper diagnosis, so people like Leão fit perfectly into the theses of Lombroso. In the eyes of Candido Motta, Leão was a born criminal, a fact reinforced by the medical report of Evaristo da Veiga who described him as a bearer of “epilepsy larvae,” one of the most perverse manifestations hidden in this kind of criminal, according to Lombroso (Motta 1925, 137-138; Lombroso 1889, 49).

After completing his study, the young attorney presented it in the public competition to become a professor at the São Paulo School of Law. Cândido Motta was approved with merit, and thus won a position in that institution. Pelagio Lobo, a historian of the School of Law, relates that Motta's appointment was commemorated as a renovation of an institution whose professors were old and out of date. Cândido Motta was one of the first of his generation to occupy a seat in the institution, which began to open up to changes in the world (Lobo 1953, 155-161). His dissertation eventually turned into a book dedicated to his inspiring mentor, Cesare Lombroso. Cândido Motta drafted a version and sent it to him by mail to Italy. The mentor, in turn, thanked him with a compliment: he said that his work was perfect (Motta 1925, 6).

Lombroso’s brand of criminal anthropology inspired lawyers, jurists and physicians throughout Latin America. Among those who stood out were: Carlos Roumagnac and Julio Guerrero in Mexico, Nina Rodrigues in Brazil, José Ingenieros in Argentina, Fernando Ortiz in Cuba and Abraham Rodríguez in Peru (Aguirre 2007, 14-54). For the American historian of Latin America, Gilbert M. Joseph, Lombroso’s discourse found fertile ground in Latin America due to the fact that the major countries of the region found themselves in the midst of radical reforms aimed at international trade. In this context, criminal anthropology became widespread as a useful practice to monitor, categorize and control an ethnically-fragmented population that had its own cultural values. This population was seen by reformers as a potential threat and hindrance to progress (Salvatore 2001, xiii-xv).

Mary Gibson notes that such criminological theory offered to Italians and Latin Americans a modern scientific doctrine that was contrary to Catholic culture, whose goal was to homogenize the population under the guise of Christian teachings. Adapting positivist theories to their national agenda, criminologists from Argentina, Brazil, Mexico and Peru leaned heavily on the doctrine of social defense in shaping new penal institutions that reinforced racial hierarchy, promoted order and consolidated the power of certain ruling groups in society. Nevertheless, Lombroso faced criticism around the world. The scientific basis of his work was severely questioned and his data and conclusions were often ridiculed. Lombroso, for instance, never investigated a sample of the Italian population outside prisons to see if it had the same physical stigmas that he identified in the inmates. One by one, French anthropologists countered the attributes identified by the Italian. They argued, in fact, that these physical attributes were more common in honest people than Lombroso previously thought (Gibson 2002).

When Motta assumed the position of professor in the Law Faculty, the work of Lombroso was already a target of criticism. An expressive number of jurists and lawyers in Brazil criticized Lombroso for denying free will and the capacity for transformation of the human spirit and for

purporting to identify criminals (Freitas 2002). Faced with this intromission, judges feared that they would lose their reason to exist, even running the risk of seeing their prerogatives taken by doctors. Those opposed to the Italian doctor lined up with French criminologists who defended the role of the courts to truly determine who were criminals and their punishment. Alexandre Lacassagne (1843-1924) and Gabriel Tarde (1843-1904), two respected French criminologists, argued that criminals were formed by a degraded environment. According to Tarde, criminals were degenerate persons, fruits of a degraded environment that needed to be reformed. In practice, the French moved from the concept of the “criminal body” to “the social body”, proposing a series of urban, institutional and sanitary reforms to combat crime and improve society (Beirne 1993, 143-176; Kaluszynski 2006, 301-316).

In Brazil, the criminological debate served to legitimize social inequality in relation to the law. Brazilian elites were pragmatic: for them, the criminological discourse offered an important element of social control, prescribing sanctions for all actions which threatened order (Alvarez 2003). Poor people, classified as the “dangerous classes”, were their preferred target. In the name of social defense and the criminological theories of the period, various institutions were created in São Paulo: the Judicial Asylum (1899), the Juvenile Discipline Institute (1903), the asylums for beggars and correctional colonies for vagrants (1907), as well as a new Penitentiary (1920) (Salla 1999, 187-189). The São Paulo police also underwent extensive reform, incorporating modern techniques and practices used by the police of Europe and the United States. In 1898, the prison population of São Paulo began to be registered by a new French method of identification, based on a series of measurements, photographs and documentation of physical particularities such as the shape of the ear and eye color. (Lisboa 1919, 7). It was a new system created by Alphonse Bertillon (1856-1914), head of the Paris police identification bureau. The system invented by Bertillon revolutionized police practice and was accepted without delay by the main Latin American cities: Buenos Aires in 1889, Mexico City and Lima in 1892, and Rio de Janeiro in 1894 (Berlière 1996, 41-47; Kaluszynski 2001, 123-138; About and Denis 2010, 73-79).

Bertillon created a system of identification which combined a register of criminal antecedents with records of each individual detained by the police. People effectively became what their criminal records said and no longer what their physical characteristics suggested. The French system substituted the “certain suspect”. Lombroso lost his appeal to a series of identification procedures carefully registered in files and police archives. This system was improved in 1901, when a group of countries consisting of Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Uruguay and Venezuela, met in Montevideo to discuss methods of identifying and joint actions against “undesirable” immigrants. The most innovative proposal came from Juan Vucetich (1858-1925), a Croatian immigrant who worked for the Argentine police. He proposed the adoption of fingerprints as a more practical and efficient method of identification, which would allow police to identify and expel people with a criminal past from Latin America territory. Fingerprinting made possible a mass identification of the native and immigrant population (Ruggiero 2001, 184-196; Rodriguez 2004, 2006). Vucetich's plan was implemented in 1905, when the police forces of Buenos Aires, Rio de Janeiro, Montevideo and Santiago set standards for the exchange of records between them (DGP 1905). São Paulo joined the covenant in 1907, using it to extradite anarchists that organized a strike which damaged the transport of coffee to the port of Santos (DGP 1907, 12-13).

Cândido Motta obstinately maintained the theories of his mentor, even with the derision of students at the end of his life (Reale 1987, 43). Even so, he played a marked role in the

construction of the frontiers of order in São Paulo. He occupied government secretaries and was elected senator without abandoning his belief in Lombroso. He was a collaborator of the Society of Forensic Medicine and Criminology of São Paulo, creator of the juvenile reform school for young offenders and Chairman of the State Penitentiary Council. When Ferri visited Brazil in 1908, Cândido Motta personally greeted him at the port of Santos. The Italian was received at the Law School with a wreath of flowers (Schwarcz 2001, 179).

By the early twentieth century, police, doctors and jurists no longer looked for physical attributes to identify common criminals. Now, vagrants, prostitutes and anarchists were registered and photographed, "becoming" what their very records said. The theory of the born criminal had lost ground, but it produced a "social panic" (Goode and Ben-Yehuda 2007), and called the attention of the population to potential criminals in the urban setting. The fear made possible the construction of a new state police apparatus that established a clear social hierarchy.

References:

Unpublished

Arquivo Público do Estado de São Paulo (APESP)

1894 Relatório apresentado ao cidadão Dr. Cesário Motta Jr. Secretário dos Negócios do Interior do Estado de São Paulo pelo diretor da Repartição de Estatística e Arquivos, Dr. Antonio Toledo Piza em 13 de julho de 1894. São Paulo: Typ. Espindola, Siqueira & Comp.

Arquivo do Tribunal de Justiça de São Paulo (ATJSP)

1896 Relatório do inquérito policial, datado de 23 de outubro de 1896. Réu: Miguel de Sant'Anna Leão

Delegacia Geral de Polícia (DGP)

1894 Relatório apresentado ao Presidente do Estado pelo Secretário dos Negócios da Justiça de São Paulo Manuel Pessoa de Siqueira Campos em 31 de março de 1894. Anexo nº2. São Paulo: Typ. Espindola, Siqueira & Comp.

1905 A Polícia Argentina e a Polícia Brasileira. Terceiro Congresso Científico Latino Americano reunido no Rio de Janeiro de 6 a 16 de agosto de 1905. Rio de Janeiro: Imprensa Nacional.

1907 Boletim Policial, nº6, ano I. Outubro de 1907.

1942 "O Professor Candido Motta". In: Arquivos da Polícia Civil do Estado de São Paulo. Vol.III, 1º semestre.

Journal

1896 Correio Paulistano

Published

About, Ilse and Denis, Vicent

2010 Histoire de l'identification des personnes. Paris: La Découverte.

Adorno, Sérgio

1988 Os Aprendizes do Poder. São Paulo: Paz e Terra.

- Aguirre, Carlos
 2007 "Prisons and Prisoners in Modernising Latin America (1800-1940)". In: *Cultures of Confinement: A History of the Prison in Africa, Asia and Latin America*, edited by Frank Dikötter and Ian Brown, 14-54. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
- Alvarez, Marcos César
 2003 *Bacharéis, Criminologistas e Juristas: Saber Jurídico e Nova Escola Penal no Brasil*. São Paulo: Ibccrim.
- Beirne, Piers
 1993 *Inventing Criminology: Essays on the Rise of "Homo Criminalis"*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.
- Berlière, Jean-Marc
 1996 *Le Monde des Polices en France*. Bruxelles: Editions Complexe.
- Bueno, José Antônio Pimenta
 1910 *Apontamentos sobre o Processo Criminal Brasileiro*. Porto: Empresa Litteraria e Typografica.
- Ferri, Enrico
 2003 *Princípios de Direito Criminal: o criminoso e o crime*. Campinas: Russell.
- Freitas, Ricardo de Brito A. P.
 2002 *As Razões do Positivismo Penal no Brasil*. Rio de Janeiro: Lumen Juris.
- Gibson, Mary
 2002 *Born to Crime: Cesare Lombroso and the Origins of Biological Criminology*. Westport: Praeger.
- Goode, Erich & Ben-Yehuda, Nachman
 2007 *Moral Panics: The Social Construction of Deviance*. Malden, MA: Blackwell.
- Gould, Stephen Jay
 1999 *A Falsa Medida do Homem*. São Paulo: Martins Fontes.
- Horn, David G.
 2003 *The Criminal Body: Lombroso and the Anatomy of Deviance*. New York: Routledge.
- Josef, Flávio
 2000 *Homicídio e Doença Mental*. Rio de Janeiro: Editora Forense.
- Joseph, Gilbert M.
 2001 "Preface". In: *Crime and Punishment in Latin America*, edited by Ricardo D. Salvatore et al., ix-xxi. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Kaluszynski, Martine
 2001 "Republican Identity: Bertillonage as Government Technique". In: *Documenting Individual Identity: The Development of State Practices in Modern World*, edited by Jane Caplan and John Torpey, 123-138. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- 2006 "The International Congresses of Criminal Antropology". In: *Criminals and Their Scientists*, edited by Peter Becker and Richard F. Wetzell, 301-316. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Lessa, Renato
 1988 *A Invenção Republicana: Campos Sales, as Bases e a Decadência da Primeira República Brasileira*. São Paulo: Vértice.

- Lisboa, Justiniano
1919 Breve Notícia da Organização do Serviço de Identificação Judiciária de S. Paulo. São Paulo: Casa Duprat.
- Lobo, Pelágio
1953 Recordações das Arcadas. São Paulo: Reitoria da USP.
- Lombroso, Cesare
1889 L'uomo delinquente. Torino: Fratelli Bocca Editori.
- Love, Joseph
1982 A Locomotiva: São Paulo na Federação Brasileira 1889-1937. Rio de Janeiro: Paz e Terra.
- Morse, Richard
1970 Formação Histórica de São Paulo. São Paulo: Difusão Européia.
- Motta, Cândido
1925 Classificação dos Criminosos. São Paulo: J. Rossetti.
- Motta Filho, Cândido
1941 Uma Grande Vida: Biografia de Bernardino de Campos. São Paulo: Companhia Editora Nacional.
1972 Contagem Regressiva. Rio de Janeiro: José Olímpio.
- Oltmanns, Thomas F. et al.
1999 Case Studies in Abnormal Psychology. New York: John Wiley & Sons.
- Palomba, Guido
1996 Loucura e Crime. São Paulo: Fiúza.
- Pinto, Maria Inez Machado Borges
1994 Cotidiano e Sobrevivência: A Vida do Trabalhador Pobre na Cidade de São Paulo (1890-1914). São Paulo: Edusp.
- Reale, Miguel
1987 Memórias: Destinos Cruzados. São Paulo: Saraiva.
- Rodriguez, Julia
2004 "South Atlantic Crossings: Fingerprints, Science, and the State in Turn-of-the-Century Argentina". *The American Historical Review*. (10 may 2010).
<<http://www.historycooperative.org/journals/ahr/109.2/rodriguez.html>>
2006 *Civilizing Argentina: Science, Medicine, and the Modern State*. Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina.
- Ross, Drew
1998 Looking into the Eyes of a Killer. New York: Plenum.
- Ruggiero, Kristin
2001 "Fingerprinting and the Argentine Plan for Universal Identification in the Late Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Century's". In: *Documenting Individual Identity: The Development of State Practices in the Modern World*, edited by Jane Caplan and John Torpey, 184-196. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Sadek, Maria Tereza (org.)
2003 Delegados de Polícia. São Paulo: Sumaré.
- Salla, Fernando
1999 As Prisões em São Paulo, 1822-1940. São Paulo: Annablume.

Schulz, John

1996 A Crise Financeira da Abolição: 1875-1901. São Paulo: Edusp.

Schwarcz, Lilia Moritz

1993 O Espetáculo das Raças: Cientistas, Instituições e Questão Racial no Brasil 1870-1930. São Paulo: Companhia das Letras.

Politics and Poetics: Exploring Socialism and *Cubanidad* in the Works of Antonio Quintana

Margaret Starkweather Hoffman
Graduate School of Architecture
University of Florida

Abstract: In this paper I will examine the works of Antonio Quintana, the only major Cuban architect to stay in Cuba after the revolution, in relationship to regionalism and politics. As one of the early adopters of modernism in Cuba, his works changed the look of Havana. He has been criticized for focusing on modern forms to the exclusion of Cuban identity, however, a closer look reveals that he integrated Cuba in his major works, and successfully incorporated regionalism with modernism. I will focus on similarities between his works and those of others prominent in modernism and Cuban architecture. By comparing Quintana's buildings with others I intend to dissect the mixture of *cubanidad*, modernism and social ideals that informed his design and made it unique.

Introduction

Cuba's long and varied heritage has left its mark on the island nation in many ways, from the character of her people to her arts and architecture. Beginning in 1492, the Spanish left a brutal mark on the country, first wiping out the indigenous people, then repopulating with Spaniards and African slaves. The city of Havana was laid out according to Spanish plans and the houses were built in the Spanish style, with adjustments made for the tropical weather. Although the Spanish continued to influence architectural style throughout their reign, as time went on other influences became apparent. The Africans brought rhythms and patterns from their native cultures that were adopted by the larger community. Tiles used as ballast on ships bound for Cuba were used on floors and walls as a cheap finish material. In keeping with the flamboyant tropical growth, flamboyant colors were used on the island.

Through all these influences, Cuba forged a national identity, even as Spain, and then the United States, dominated the nation. The drumbeats brought to Cuba from Africa melded with sensual rhythms of life in the tropics to become a unique form of music, while visual arts moved through stages of representational depictions of the fantastic flora of the island to abstract ideas of what it is to be Cuban. Even religious philosophy underwent significant changes. Although the Spaniards imposed Catholicism on their subjects, the influences of African beliefs became mixed with elements of Catholicism to become a unique religion known as Santería. Together, these cultural mixtures became known as *cubanidad*, the essence of being Cuban.

Not all of the influences on Cuba are so obvious or so distant in history. Modern Cuba would probably be a very different place today if not for a revolution that changed the political and intellectual atmosphere throughout the world. The Bolshevik Revolution began in 1917, at the end of World War I, and resulted in the formation of the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics (USSR). The USSR was founded on the economic principles of Karl Marx and his associate, Frederick Engels, who were proponents of communism and socialism. Even before the political polarization of the Cold War, the formation of the USSR had a profound impact on

the world. In the wake of World War I, with the devastation it wrought in Europe, social issues on a large scale came to the fore. Many women and children were left without the family support they had previously enjoyed, while at the same time much of the housing stock had been destroyed by bombing. Soldiers coming home from the war needed housing, and a soothing environment. Within this framework, many of the ideals of socialism were appealing. The USSR brought these ideals to the forefront, renewing debates among intellectuals who had long been aware of Marx and Engels, and exposing even the commoner to these theories. Many artists, including architects, were especially attracted to the ideals of Marx, who saw human nature as transformative and thoughtful.

The same events that exposed many to the writings of Marx also repelled many. The violence of the Bolshevik Revolution and the subsequent purges were repugnant to those who had just lived through World War I. Marx's communism had been replaced with a bloody revolution that did nothing to restore power to the masses, instead consolidating power into a political core whose members shared the same benefits that the overthrown nobility had enjoyed. This caused a certain unease between the ideal and the reality.

The modern movement in architecture shares many social ideals that are very similar to those of Marx. Both movements are concerned with the treatment of the working classes, believing them to be noble in a way that nobility has never been. Both Marx and many of the modernists shared a fervent belief that social change was necessary, and that the working class was important enough to share in the best that society could offer. Le Corbusier, one of the founders of modernism, wrote extensively about the ideals that should govern building in the modern age. One of his most influential works, first published in 1924, *Toward an Architecture*, (also known as *Toward a New Architecture*) contains passages which are barely disguised reworkings of Marx's *Communist Manifesto*. In Le Corbusier's chapter entitled "Architecture or Revolution," he speaks at length of the changes to family due to the industrial revolution, and points out how the modern worker uses the tools of industry in everyday work but cannot reap the benefits of those tools (Le Corbusier 1924, 293-297). Similarly, Marx points out that the workers since the industrial revolution have made many things using modern tools, but are falling far behind in their own standards of living (Marx 1848).

Le Corbusier was hardly alone among architects in echoing Marx. A proliferation of architectural manifestoes was written, many with language eerily similar to the *Communist Manifesto*. The De Stijl Manifesto of 1918 states that a ". . . new consciousness of the age . . . is directed at the universal" (Conrads 1977, 39). The Work Council for Art states that "Art shall no longer be the enjoyment of the few but the life and happiness of the masses" (Conrads 1977, 44). The CIAM (International Congress of Modern Architecture) Charter of Athens states that cities are in a state of chaos due to "the ceaseless increase of private interests since the beginning of the machine age" and goes on to detail town planning in which housing is the primary consideration (Conrads 1977, 137-145). Each of these manifestoes was widely read by architects interested in the modern movement.

This is not to say that socialism or communism are exactly the same ideals espoused by modernists. Despite the similarities between the manifestos, the modernists in general did not espouse the struggle that Marx called for. In *Toward an Architecture*, Le Corbusier makes this clear as in the end he pulls away from fully supporting Marx by stating, "Architecture or revolution. Revolution can be avoided." (Le Corbusier 1924, 307) In this way, he makes it clear that he is calling strictly for social changes, rather than a violent uprising, because he fully believes that architecture has the power to completely change society.

It took some years for modernism to truly take hold in architecture among the masses, the ones for whom the changes were supposed to most benefit. Although most of these writings were in the early part of the 20th century, and Europe, along with many larger cities such as Chicago and Brasilia, had seen modernist buildings as early as the late 19th century, it was not until the middle of the 20th century that many smaller cities and suburban areas in North America saw an abundance of modernist buildings. This coincided with a tremendous building boom in Cuba that gave many young architects a chance to bring the ideals they had studied in school into the city of Havana. In 1941, the group Agrupacion Tectonica de Estudios Contemporaneos (ATEC) allied with CIAM, formed in Cuba, to forge a modern identity for Cuban architecture. Nearly all of the young architects joined ATEC or a related group, Arquitectos Unidos, to discuss modern housing needs in the rapidly expanding city (Loomis 1999, 5-6). Among these architects was Antonio Quintana, who was the only one of the group to remain in Cuba after the revolution.

Antonio Quintana, who was born in Cuba in 1919 just two years after the beginning of the Soviet Union, was certainly exposed to socialism and its ideals as he grew up. At the end of World War II, the USSR had become one of the key players in the global theater and was seeking to expand its influence, just as the United States was. Throughout the world, chapters of the Communist Party were being founded, including in Cuba. The Partido Comunista de Cuba (PCC) was founded in 1925, consolidating the smaller groups that had been scattered around the country. The PCC was largely an underground group, but was not small.

Many young artists and architects of the time considered themselves Marxists, and those in Cuba were no exception (Loomis 1999). ATEC meetings consisted of discussions of righting social ills, a common theme in the years following World War II. Architecture and socialism converged on this theme more strongly than other disciplines and political systems. The visual and performing arts can draw attention to the plight of the underclass and call for change, but only architecture can fundamentally change the environment which the workers live in. Likewise, in order to effect a large-scale change in environment for the workers, redistribution of wealth, the very thing that socialism calls for, is required.

Quintana appears to have taken the ideals of socialism and the modernist movement to heart in choosing how he would work and what commissions he would seek. While his contemporaries worked closely with the upper class, earning commissions from the highest echelons of government and society, Quintana worked much more in the realm of the working class, designing small apartment buildings, middle-class housing and a few larger buildings to house medical offices and apartments. He did not revel in luxurious mansions, designing homes for the Bacardi's or nightclubs that only the wealthy and the Americans would frequent. Notably absent from his portfolio are hotels and presidential palaces. Instead he designed well-thought out but small homes that workers would inhabit and other practical buildings for the working class.

Heavily influenced by modern architects such as Le Corbusier and Oscar Niemeyer, Quintana, along with his contemporaries, began designing buildings that were unlike anything seen in Cuba before. These architects changed the look of Havana, bringing it in line with what was happening throughout the world, especially in nearby Florida. Miami was just a short plane trip away, and echoes of American modernism bloomed in Havana. With all the imported forms and far-flung influences, it is not surprising that Ricardo Porro, an architect several years his junior, denigrated Quintana for a lack of *cubanidad*. However, this was a short-sighted view of things made by one who was not there to see the initial excitement of the building boom.

(Loomis 1999, 10-11) Cuba was much more than just the canvas on which Quintana worked. To every building he designed, Quintana brought a new way to be both Cuban and modern. Elements of traditional Cuban architecture reworked to fit into the modern vernacular are in evidence in all of his work. At the same time, a refusal to be dominated by the echoes of Spanish colonialism is evident in his reinterpretation of Cuban architecture.

Cuban architecture had long been dominated by Spanish styling and lavish baroque trimmings, with borrowed elements of African culture added. Ornament such as lacey ironwork was common on buildings throughout the country. With the rise of the modern movement, however, young architects such as Antonio Quintana sought to bring an end to the ostentatious ornamentation and begin to build a modern Cuba. The rise of this generation coincided with a worldwide building boom that did not leave Cuba untouched. Havana was rapidly expanding in the 1950s, offering great opportunities for experimenting with new methods.. New materials, which in Cuba meant mostly concrete, were being used in building. Concrete was the most practical of the new materials to use in Cuba, where there was very little industrialization or access to steel, but there was an abundance of cheap, skilled labor. Quintana adopted this new material, and frequently worked in unfinished, grey concrete. The starkness of this material differed from the brightly colored buildings of old Havana, but was a perfect foil for the magnificent colors of the tropical landscape.

Luyano Housing Estate

Any discussion of Quintana's career must begin with his first major work, which is notably the only public housing project to be built in Havana before the revolution. The Luyano Housing Estate was begun in 1947 specifically to house the working class (Segre, Coyula, Scarpaci 1997, 72-73). Although Cuban involvement in World War II was minimal, and did not include the rush of homecoming soldiers that other countries experienced, the housing boom did not pass them over. Spurred by renewed prosperity within Cuba and the United States, the government promised to build housing for the impoverished, if for no other reason than to improve the aesthetics of Havana. The prosperity of the United States translated into more tourism for Cuba, and the inevitable clean-up of its largest city.

In the Luyano Housing Estates, we see several threads that carry through Quintana's career. The first is the well-planned living spaces in the multi-family units: small, but efficient living spaces with no hint of luxury but with all the tools necessary to be comfortable. The second is the architecture itself, which is strongly modern, but which also brings in elements of traditional Cuban architecture stripped of ornament. The most obvious Cuban elements, patios, porticos and persianas (louvered shutters), help bring an opacity to Cuban architecture that is not often seen in modern buildings, even in tropical climates. More particular to Quintana, a theme arises of strong verticals set against strong horizontals, and an elevation of the first floor.

The Luyano Housing Estate was originally conceived as a compound of 1500 houses and eight apartment buildings with support spaces such as stores and playgrounds. Noted urban planner Pedro Martinez oversaw the development of the project, while a team of young architects that included Quintana, Mario Romanach, and Jorge Mantilla, designed the buildings (Segre, Coyula, Scarpaci 1997, 72-73). The apartments were built in a modern style, devoid of the ornamentation that Cubans were used to seeing. These bold buildings had external circulation towers that connected to the units through horizontal walkways that mitigated the harsh tropical sun by their very depth, and offered the coolness of concrete as a building material. These deep recesses, along with balconies on either end of each building, also acted as

the porches that were ubiquitous in Cuban architecture. On the back side of the apartments, persianas helped control the light while providing ventilation, another element that was considered essential to a feeling of *cubanidad*.

Although the project was soon abandoned with fewer than half of the apartments built and only 177 of 1500 of the houses completed, this was an important first step in Quintana's career (Segre, Coyula, Scarpaci, 1997 73). Although this was to be the only project attempted for workers' housing until after the revolution, Quintana continued to work mainly on small housing projects that were suitable for the working class. He became known for developing modern and rational solutions to small living quarters (Escolano 2005 90).

Small Apartment Homes

In 1952, Quintana and Alberto Beale, his partner of the time, designed two small apartment buildings with a simple plan based on Le Corbusier's Domino House. The Domino House was a framework Le Corbusier had suggested as a way to build workers' housing that was flexible enough to embrace individual and regional needs. It was a simple plan, consisting of three slabs that formed the floors and roof, connected by stairs. The frames were intended to be built and delivered to a job site, where the finishes and interiors were to be altered to fit the needs of the site (Le Corbusier 1924, 255-263). Le Corbusier's dream of this mass-production housing form was never fully realized, but the idea influenced many designs by other architects. Quintana and Beale saw the usefulness of the simple frame and adapted it to use in Cuba.

These apartments, Apartamientos Caballero in Vibora and Apartamientos Revilla in Vedado, were much more graceful than the Luyano Housing Estate. Built within the framework of the Domino House, they are designed to fit their context, with details that provide shade from the hot Cuban sun and ventilation to cool the interiors. Le Corbusier's drawings of Domino Houses push the enclosed spaces to the edges, but the buildings by Quintana and Beale pull back the enclosed space to form large open porches. This is in keeping with the tradition of Cuban porches, but also to provide shade from the sun. Apertures to the apartments are in the deep recesses of these porches, while the sides of the buildings have no windows at all. The roofs open partially to the sky to create large light-filled spaces that protect just enough from the sun. Built in concrete, with little color to detract from the landscape, these apartments advertise themselves as cool respites from the tropical heat, while acting as a perfect foil for the tropical lushness.

The only clear differences between the apartments are that Apartamientos Caballero includes louvers along the side of its porches, while Apartamientos Revilla has a single column to define the space of the porch. Although these buildings clearly have modernist roots, unlike many modern buildings with similar plans these are peculiarly opaque, as are many other Cuban buildings. Although any good architect building in a tropical climate would be careful to shade their building, many still remained obsessed with the transparency of glass, crafting glass boxes under large canopies. Quintana and Beale stayed true to Cuban sensibilities and created these apartments to be delicate even without transparency with persianas that serve to block both sight and light. The proportions of the columns against the horizontal slabs combined with the recesses of the porches allow the buildings to appear as though they rest lightly on the earth, while those same columns allow the sun to paint patterns across the walls, further enhancing their delicacy. The apartments themselves are compact living spaces, designed to maximize efficiency for the working class inhabitants. Each of these units has just enough space for a

family to live, but no space for luxuries. It is clear that these are not apartments for the wealthy, but well-thought out rooms for the working class.

Private Houses

Although his compatriots had early on shown interest in Marxist ideals, they seem to have quickly moved away from them when it came time to actually earn a living. With Cuba's building boom and tourist industry, there were many large and luxurious buildings commissioned during this time, and these were the buildings that Quintana's associates became known for. However, rather than the larger, more public projects that his peers sought, Quintana designed small houses for the working class. These small houses were designed with attention to the details of life, with kitchens and living areas designed for a housewife rather than a paid cook, and included such traditional details as courtyards, louvers and porches. Here, two of the more widely publicized houses typical of Quintana's style are detailed.

Both the Residencia Goudie and the Residencia Dr. E. Casuso are small houses that incorporate traditional aspects of Cuban life, including courtyards that provide living space that is neither outside nor in, but rather both. In some ways these two houses are similar; each has an overhanging roof to provide shade, each has persianas to control the light entering the living spaces, and they are similar in size. However, each of these houses has a different approach to the creation of a courtyard. Residencia Goudie is raised above the ground plain and appears to float on the hedges that border it, with only the stairs touching the ground. A winding staircase connects the interior living space of the house directly to the courtyard, which could be called an outside room. Partially tiled and partially planted, the courtyard offers shade and promises tropical lushness. The Residencia Dr. E. Casuso in Miramar rests firmly on the ground, or at least it seems to. What appears to be a conventional lower level to the house is actually a courtyard which sits below the house, with louvered panels in front to give it a feeling of solidity. The entrance to the home is through this courtyard rather than through a front door. The louvers of the courtyard are continued on the windows of the enclosed living quarters.

To modern eyes, these houses may not stand out as working class houses, but at the time they were built there were several elements that set them apart from the wealthier homes. The most obvious is that there were no servants quarters, which were commonplace in wealthier Cuban homes. This lack points to the fact that the owners would do the housework, rather than to pay someone else to do it. Along the same lines, the kitchens of these houses are small, designed for one person to work in, with the eating space in the kitchen itself. These homes were not made for entertaining, but simply for living.

Apartment Building of Enriqueta Fernandez

The Apartment Building of Enriqueta Fernandez, completed in 1953, was a small building designed to house the lower-middle class. It incorporates many of the elements that Quintana is known for. The whole building originally floated above the landscape on pilotis, a construct borrowed directly from Le Corbusier's vernacular, which allowed for a courtyard and display space below the building. The courtyard was turned into an auto dealership while retaining the illusion of floating; however, in later years it was fully enclosed, losing much of the impact of the original design (Rodriguez 2000, 9.16).

The circulation core is separate from the building, attached by walkways, which allows for greater ventilation within the apartments. The vertical circulation core, juxtaposed with the horizontal walkways, makes the otherwise bland rear of the building more interesting. Apertures

run up along the spine of the core and over the walkways to heighten the play of vertical against horizontal. This south-facing rear façade is much more enclosed than the front, with small, louvered windows that keep out most of the sun.

On the north façade, individual duplex units are clearly delineated from each other by balconies that run along the front of each unit, separated from the neighbors by concrete walls. The elements that form the balconies give the impression of a large tic-tac-toe board, as the resulting units are nearly square. Large windows with operable louvered shutters allow the residents to control the sunlight entering the units. The set-back from the balcony to the enclosure of the apartments allows for significant sun-shading, and privacy. Between the louvers and the set-back, these apartments that appear light and airy from inside, seem almost entirely opaque from without.

Above the dozen units sits a single story penthouse that almost disappears when the building is viewed from the street. This is not a showy penthouse designed for the wealthy, but rather a modestly-sized penthouse that offered slightly better views than the homes below. It was more an architectural detail than a show of money. Like the apartments below, the penthouse has louvered windows, allowing for light control. Rather than the balcony that offers shade to the other apartments, an oversized slab roof similar to those on Quintana's houses, sits atop the penthouse, visually connecting it to the sides of the building, which extend beyond the top of the apartments.

Although there are elements of these apartments that are clearly influenced by modernists such as Le Corbusier, this building is at its essence a singularly Cuban design. The opacity of the facades, the lightness of the concrete structure, the balcony-porches and the louvers of the windows are all designed to make the most of the tropical landscape and climate, and to appeal to Cuban tastes. The use of concrete as opposed to steel and glass makes the most of skilled labor, while avoiding the cost of importing non-Cuban materials. Even the later enclosure of the bottom floors was planned to highlight the tropical feeling of Cuba, with lush greenery that offers shade from the hot sun.

Odontological Building

One of Quintana's most well-known buildings is the Odontological Building in El Vedado which received the Gold Medal Prize awarded by the College of Architects. Built in 1953, it closely resembles the Ministry of Education and Public Health in Rio de Janeiro which was completed in 1943 and was designed by Lucio Costa and Oscar Niemeyer, with input from Le Corbusier. The Ministry in Rio is designed with operable brise soleils, or sunshades. In Quintana's Odontological Building, the sunshades are formed of louvers that run the length of the building, interrupted between windows with vertical elements. The number of louvers varies from floor to floor, giving a vertical rhythm to the building rather than strict repetition.

The Odontological Building consists of a double tower connected by a circulation core, with brise soleils covering both the south and west sides. While the Ministry of Education building had similar brise soleils, those on Quintana's building are more severe, without the operability of the ones on the Ministry building. The brise soleils on the Odontological Building have been criticized as being too repetitive, and visually overdone. However, unlike the Ministry building, they are interrupted at both the ground level and mezzanine level, which plays perfectly against the backdrop of repetition. The louvers of the brise soleils echo those found within other Cuban architecture, which are always evenly spaced and designed to keep light out.

With the open mezzanine acting as a porch, the building embraces *cubanidad* in the spirit of modernism.

The brise soleils restrict the view from most windows within the building. To many this may appear strange, but since windows in Cuba have been seen more as a means of ventilation and light than of views, this is entirely in keeping with local traditions. Only the ground and mezzanine levels open up to the outside world, with large patios that remain shaded from the sun while letting in air and light. Visually, the interruptions in repetition differentiate the public spaces from the offices that form the majority of the building. The lobby at ground level offered a Mariano Rodriguez fresco that represents the history of medicine with a uniquely Cuban flair (Rodriguez 2000, 9.18). Although frescoes adorned lobbies in many modernist buildings, particularly those in Latin America, the use of a local artist was an important means of bringing local culture into the building.

Seguro Medico Building

Quintana's most widely recognized work is the Seguro Medico Building which was completed in 1958, on Calle 23, the same street as the famed Havana Hilton. Although its name implies that it is an office building, the office and retail spaces are found only on the lower levels, while the rest of the space is apartments. The two entrances of the building each feature a mural by a Cuban artist. The office entrance on Calle 23 has a Wifredo Lam mural in the lobby, while the apartment entrance on N Street has one by Mariano Rodriguez (HavanaArchitecture.org). Like the Odontological Building, this building earned Quintana the Gold Medal Prize, but inspired much less criticism. Oriented to make the most of natural phenomena rather than following the street as the other buildings along Calle 23 do, the Seguro Medico Building makes its presence felt on the street.

The form of the building is of one low horizontal block oriented along an east-west axis topped by a tall horizontal block oriented north and south. Connecting these blocks is a smaller vertical element that contains a separate circulation core. The south façade, which faces Calle 23, is the rear of the building. It could have been too blank, but the circulation core is placed on this side, giving it a strong vertical feeling. Walkways give a measured rhythm to this side, with concrete screens and reveals that allow glimpses of color to show through. By placing this façade toward the busiest street, not only is the heat of the sun effectively blocked from the interior, but the noise of the street is diminished, allowing the apartments to be quieter and more private.

It is the north façade that Seguro Medico is most known for, with its brightly colored staggered balconies, which are tiled rather than painted their bright colors, tying in the tradition of using tiles brought as ballast by old trading ships. Traditional louvered windows flank the balconies on each side, which allow occupants to either take advantage of the cool northern light or to shut it out and keep the interior darkened (HavanaArchitecture.org). On the west and east sides, where the tower is a solid slab of concrete, brise soleils run the length of the base with brightly colored walls offset below them. The brise soleil covered base of the building, which houses shopping and offices, is much larger than bases of other buildings by Quintana, but it does still give the tower the impression of floating, as the tower's walls extend beyond the base. The more loosely structured brise soleils contrasted with the walls below are more musical than those of the Odontological Building. Set as they are with more vertical elements than horizontal, these brise soleils appear to be louvered windows set on their side.

With more obvious notes of *cubanidad*, the Seguro Medico Building earned Quintana accolades from both modernists and Cubans, showing clearly that there is no dichotomy between being a regionalist and being a modern. The thoughtful efficiency of these apartments with attention to internal comfort rather than external show give a glimpse into Quintana's mindset, making it obvious once again that even when faced with a larger commission, social issues outweighed financial ones in his design.

Post Revolution Buildings

For most of the Cuban architects, the Revolution would be the end of their careers in Cuba, as almost to a man they fled or were exiled from the island after 1959. However, Quintana stayed in Cuba and continued to work as an architect. At the same time many architects were leaving Cuba, there was an influx of other architects who were attracted to Cuba precisely for political reasons, such as Ricardo Porro, a Cuban who had earlier been exiled from Cuba for socialist activities but returned after the Revolution, and the Italian born architects Roberto Segre, Roberto Gottardi and Vittorio Garatti. (Loomis 1999 13-15)

It is at this point that it becomes more evident that Quintana himself was more committed to socialist ideals, as it was difficult for those who were not to remain in Cuba. As further evidence of this commitment, he was appointed to project manager at the Ministry of Construction and began teaching at the University of Havana in 1961, foregoing private practice for public works. (ecured.cu)

In keeping with his interest for housing for the working class, Quintana designed an 18-story apartment building on Calle Malecon in 1967. This dual-building is staggered in both plan and section and connected by a vertical circulation core. The stairs between the buildings are sheathed with vertical louvers that allow air to flow through the courtyard formed by the two buildings. While the view from the courtyard formed by the towers and circulation core is attractive, the width between the buildings is not sufficient to allow light to penetrate the lower apartments. These louvers and the building's position on the Malecon are the most Cuban elements of the apartments, which look as much as if they could have been designed by a Soviet brutalist as by a Cuban modernist. In this building, there is none of the floating or play against horizontal and vertical elements that are so evident in Quintana's earlier works. The concrete gives a heavy appearance to the whole project, which looks more institutional than residential.

Las Ruinas

In the 1970s, a large park with many attractions was built in homage to Lenin. Quintana designed a restaurant for the park, Las Ruinas. It is evident from this work that he was still capable of finding joy in design. Begun on the ruins of a coffee plantation, Las Ruinas is a sculptural walk through the woods. More than simply the building, he sculpted volumetric paths through the woods that lead to enormous volumes described by layered exposed concrete beams and columns. The beams continue inside the restaurant, piercing the walls and large windows. Windows run the length of the walls, bringing in light and framing views of the park. Concrete columns shore up the stone ruins that define the walls and bring the outside in through moss and ferns growing on them. Everything about this project is open and filled with light. A brightly colored window above the staircase brings both light and color into the restaurant while evoking the architecture of old Cuba. This work seems to be an almost complete departure from his earlier works, with much more freedom than anything else he had designed. The openness of the space is extraordinary.

In 1993, at the age of 74, Antonio Quintana passed away. In an odd parallel to his birth, he died just two years after the fall of the Soviet Union. His legacy remains in the streets of Havana, telling the tale of his dedication to his country, his ideals and his craft.

Acknowledgments: Special thanks to Professor Alfonso Perez-Mendez for his course on Cuban Modernism and for introducing me to the works of Antonio Quintana.

References:

CIAM

1977 "CIAM: Charter of Athens: tenets." In *Programs and manifestoes on 20th-century architecture*, edited by Ulrich Conrads, 137-145. Cambridge: The MIT Press, 1977 ed.

Eaton, Tracy

2009 <http://alongthemalecon.blogspot.com/2009/10/cuban-architect-known-for-modernism.html>

ecured.cu

First accessed March 21, 2011.

HavanaArchitecture.org

2009 First accessed November 11, 2009.

Loomis, John A.

1999 *Revolution of Forms: Cuba's Forgotten Art Schools*. New York: Princeton Architectural Press.

Neutra, Richard

Is Planning Possible: can destiny be designed? No publisher or date noted.

Le Corbusier

1924 *Toward an Architecture*. Los Angeles: Getty Research Institute, 2007 ed.

Marx, Karl

1848 *The Communist Manifesto*. www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/.

Perez Escalano, Victor

2003 "A European Glance in the Mirror of Modern Architecture" in *Architecture Beyond: European Architecture Beyond Europe* <http://www.architecturebeyond.eu/>

Rodriguez, Eduardo Luis

2000 *The Havana Guide: Modern Architecture 1925-1965*. New York: Princeton Architectural Press.

Segre, Roberto, Mario Coyula and Joseph L. Scarpaci

1997 *Havana: Two Faces of the Antillean Metropolis*. New York: John Wiley & Sons.

Staubli, Willy

1966 *Brasilia*. London: Leonard Hill Books.

van Doesburg, Theo, Robt. van 't Hoff, Vilmos Huszar, Antony Kok, Piet Mondrian, G. Vantongerloo, and Jan Wils

1918 "'De Stijl': Manifesto 1." In *Programs and Manifestoes on 20th-Century Architecture*, Edited by Ulrich Conrads, 39. Cambridge: The MIT Press, 1977 Ed.

Work Council for Art

1919 "Work Council for Art: Under the Wing of a Great Architecture." In *Programs and Manifestoes on 20th-Century Architecture*, Edited by Ulrich Conrads, 44. Cambridge: The MIT Press, 1977 Ed.

Fair Trade in Peru: An Analysis of the Current Situation

Alicia del Carmen Mariñas Tapia
Graduate School of Asia Pacific Studies
Ritsumeikan Asia Pacific University

Abstract: This article focuses on Fair Trade and establishing a background for its development in Peru. Initially, general information concerning the Fair Trade movement is presented. The background for Peru is constructed based on the economic strategies, as well as on the agricultural and artisanal products that Peru produces. The article presents data obtained from the Fair Trade Labelling Organisation and the World Fair Trade Organization, together with interview material, which allowed an analysis of the Peruvian presence within the movement. From the data presented, Peru appears as a major player in the Fair Trade movement, and given patterns of international demand, the future for Fair Trade products looks encouraging.

Introduction

In today's world, where frontiers are relatively open, economic openness, growing economic interdependence and deepening economic integration are making globalization predominant. In this globalized world, international trade has been a major source of growth for both developed and developing countries. International trade is understood as the exchange of capital, goods and services among the countries of the world economy, and it can have significant positive effects on economic growth, development, and poverty reduction. However, the distribution of benefits and costs has been unequal and many poor countries have been unable to use trade as an engine for development (Stiglitz and Charlton 2005, 25; Nielson 2006, 319). Moreover, for decades it has been seen that the unfairness of international trade has troubled people, producing and widening inequalities within and between countries.

Thus, the international trading system has failed to deliver decent livelihoods to millions of producers in the developing world and has also had negative human and environmental effects (Hutchens 2009, 55; Murray and Reynolds 2007, 6). The lack of infrastructure, institutions, market information and market access represent major constraints that impede producers in developing countries in benefiting from trade. In this context, Fair Trade has emerged as a response to the negative effects of contemporary globalization represented by free trade (Murray and Reynolds 2007, 6).

Originally, Fair Trade was called "Alternative Trade", as it provided an alternative to conventional international trade, which was seen as tending to marginalize small-scale producers within the market⁶. The Fair Trade Movement has now been developing for a number of years and the importance of the movement has grown throughout the world. In 2008, global Fair Trade sales reached 2,894 million Euros,⁷ increasing by 22 per cent from the previous year despite the global recession, and Fair Trade products now include a large variety of agricultural commodities as well as handcrafts.

⁶ World Fair Trade Organization. <<http://www.wfto.com/>> (accessed as IFAT in October 2008).

⁷ Fairtrade Labelling Organizations International, *Fair Trade Leading the Way, Annual Report 2008-09*. Fair Trade global sales: 2,894, 711,217 Euros.

This article seeks to analyse the development of the Fair Trade movement in Peru and establish a framework for its analysis, aiming to shed light on the operations of the movement, and to see it from a producer country perspective. The paper is based on information obtained from FLO-CERT⁸ in April 2009 regarding certified operators from Peru, together with interview data from institutions that support the development of Fair Trade in Peru, and fieldwork observations based on rapid appraisal methods⁹. The paper begins with consideration of the defining characteristics of the Fair Trade movement.

The Fair Trade Movement

A common definition of Fair Trade which is used widely throughout the movement has been developed by FINE¹⁰, the Fair Trade organizations' forum: "Fair Trade is a trading partnership, based on dialogue, transparency and respect, that seeks greater equity in international trade. It contributes to sustainable development by offering better trading conditions to, and securing the rights of, marginalised producers and workers – especially in the South".

The objective of Fair Trade is therefore to empower producers to develop their own businesses and communities through international trade instead of aid, improving in this way farmers' and workers' livelihoods through direct sales, better prices, and stable market links, as well as supporting producer organizations and communities (Raynolds and Long 2007, 15).

Inside the Fair Trade movement, consumers play an important role in improving the situation for producers in developing countries (Micheletti 2003, 94). Fair Trade purpose is not only to establish a direct relationship between producers and consumers but to achieve greater understanding among consumers of the need of producers for support for their independent development (Barratt Brown 1993, 156).

Fair Trade is usually defined by several key practices:

- Direct purchasing from producers with an emphasis on transparent and long-term trading partnerships.
- Ensuring prices for producers that cover the average cost of production¹¹.
- Payment to producers of an agreed social premium (often 10 per cent or more of the cost price of goods)¹².
- Provision of advance payments to producers¹³.
- Provision of market information to producers.
- A requirement that farmers and workers should be organized democratically, in accordance with International Labour Organization (ILO) conventions.

⁸ FLO-CERT: is the certification body for labeled Fair Trade.

⁹ The field work was carried out in Peru in February and March 2009. Thanks to GRESP for their kind collaboration.

¹⁰ FINE: is a platform created to promote Fair Trade. The acronym FINE stands for the initial letters of Fairtrade Labelling Organizations International (FLO), International Fair Trade Association (IFAT), now the World Fair Trade Organization (WFTO), Network of European Worldshops (NEWS!), and the European Fair Trade Association (EFTA).

¹¹ Prices are set by taking account of local economic conditions to allow producers a living wage from their work.

¹² This practice corresponds to the product certification approach. The social premium is paid on top of the Fair Trade price, allowing farmers and workers to collectively implement larger development projects decided democratically.

¹³ Importers are required to pay in advance up to 60 per cent of the total purchase price, if requested by producers.

- Adherence to sustainable practices.

“Fair Trade represents a new approach to the buyer-supplier transaction which aims at equality of exchange within a partnership...” (Nicholls and Opal 2005, 7). It also focuses on the producer rather than the consumer, with contracts that seek to maximise returns to suppliers rather than buyers margins, in an agreed developmental structure (Nicholls and Opal 2005, 7).

According to Nicholls and Opal (2005, 13), some economists see Fair Trade as an abnormality¹⁴. Their argument is that the price structure fails to obey the rules of a free market, with prices that are driven by humanitarian issues rather than the free interaction of supply and demand, and that this situation fosters and encourages uncompetitive production. Ethical consumer behaviour is seen as highly irrational as it does not aim to maximise the financial utility of the purchaser (Nicholls and Opal 2005, 13). Thus, Fair Trade presents an image of the economy in which consumers look beyond the value of money, to consider the social context within which things are made and the role these things play in sustaining meaningful human relationships (Luetchford 2008, 153).

Fair Trade Certification

An essential element of the Fair Trade model is product certification. In 1997, several international initiatives led to the formation of Fair Trade Labelling Organisations International (FLO). FLO is the organization responsible for setting the producer and minimum pricing guidelines for products to carry the Fair Trade Mark, and FLO-CERT is the company that inspects producers and traders to verify their compliance with the Fair Trade standards. Hence, FLO’s tasks are numerous and every year only a few new product groups, mostly agricultural, are certified (Nicholls and Opal 2005, 12). FLO’s central goal has been to take Fair Trade beyond its historical Alternative Trade roots and move it into the supermarket (Murray and Raynolds 2007, 8).

Currently, many Fair Trade products are certified as such by the award of a Fair Trade Mark. FLO’s mark guarantees independent auditing of Fair Trade goods and offers consumers an important degree of reassurance when buying Fair Trade products. Given that Fair Trade products are usually more expensive than other substitutes because of the higher prices given to producers, the mark is especially important. However, not all Fair Trade products bear the mark yet, not because they are produced outside Fair Trade guidelines, but as a result of the sometimes complex, expensive, and difficult process of acquiring the mark (Nicholls and Opal 2005, 11).

Fair Trade certified products have helped build economic independence and empowerment for small-scale producer organizations and their members, bringing them economic stability and higher living standards. Aside from being paid a fair price (the Fair Trade floor price) for their goods, the premium helps producers to build the social infrastructure needed by their communities¹⁵.

Europe and North America have become important markets for a growing number of Fair Trade certified products. This market success is based on the engagement of large scale retailers, branders, and other corporations, which bring Fair Trade into the mainstream. In the North, widespread and growing public support has emerged for the Fair Trade concept and Fair Trade products. This support has enabled the move of Fair Trade from the margins of the market to the mainstream, with the increasing involvement of dominant corporate brands like Procter &

¹⁴ See, for instance, Sidwell 2008 and Lindsey 2004.

¹⁵ Fair Trade Labelling Organizations International. About Fair Trade. Fair Trade Labelling Organizations International. <<http://www.Fair Trade.net/home.html>> (accessed December 2008).

Gamble and Nestlé, and major supermarket chains like Tesco, Carrefour, and Sam's Club (Murray and Reynolds 2007, 8).

On the other hand, handicrafts produced under the Fair Trade guidelines do not carry the Fair Trade Mark as there is no certification by FLO for products of this nature. In these cases, the World Fair Trade Organization (WFTO) is in charge of monitoring those organizations which are 100 per cent committed to Fair Trade. The WFTO has its own logo that serves to identify the members who are judged to be working in accordance with Fair Trade principles in all their business activities¹⁶.

Fair Trade products

According to Nicholls and Opal (2005, 24), “until the 1990’s, handicrafts dominated Fair Trade sales, [but] since 1991... food has taken over as the most important category in terms of sales volume and growth.” One of the factors influencing this change was that Fair Trade food positioned itself to provide premium quality rather than ethical standards. On the other hand, “Fair Trade crafts... did not reposition themselves to address new markets, preferring instead to consolidate their position with the Alternative Trading Organizations (ATOs) and ‘worldshops’¹⁷” (Nicholls and Opal 2005, 24). Additionally, the Fair Trade Certification process is better suited to agricultural commodities, such as coffee. The complications inherent in handicraft certification include the countless diverse production techniques and specifications and the difficulty of devising and auditing certification standards that could be applied to all of them. Therefore, “crafts do not benefit from the marketing impact of a Fair Trade product logo. This reduces their appeal outside ... [the] ATO environment, and limits their ability to ... [be differentiated from other similar] non-Fair Trade products” (Nicholls and Opal 2005, 24). The lack of a mark also undermines consumer trust in the Fair Trade production process of the goods and diminishes customer loyalty, hindering attempts to market the goods at a premium price (Nicholls and Opal 2005, 24).

Usually the Fair Trade products are sold through three main channels: dedicated retail outlets, supermarkets, and mail order. According to Moore (2004, 75), in Europe there are approximately 2,700 worldshops and Fair Trade products are available in 43,000 supermarkets throughout the continent. In the USA and Canada in 2001, there were at least 7,000 retail outlets for Fair Trade products. Mail order generally accounts for less than 10 per cent of an importing organization’s turnover, although on line retailing facilities may affect this channel in the future. In addition to these main channels, the other retail channels are solidarity groups, whole food shops, and independent commercial stores (Moore 2004, 75).

Coffee is the second largest internationally traded commodity after oil, and among the Fair Trade certified products it is the most important. Of other Fair Trade products, bananas are only just entering the large U.S.A. market, but have already captured major portions of the European markets. Here, Switzerland leads accounts, with roughly 50 per cent of their total national banana sales being Fair Trade. Fair Trade certified commodities now include not only coffee and bananas, but also tea, cocoa, sugar, honey, fresh fruits and vegetables, dried fruit, fruit juices, rice, wine, nuts and oilseeds, cut flowers, ornamental plants, cotton, and sports balls, with plans for certifying many other products under way (Murray and Reynolds 2007, 9).

The next section begins describing the Peruvian economic strategies, including detailed information about Peru’s agricultural and artisanal products, in order to provide a context for

¹⁶ World Fair Trade Organization. <<http://www.wfto.com/>> (accessed as IFAT in October 2008).

¹⁷ Worldshops is the name conventionally adopted by dedicated retail outlets.

understanding how the Fair Trade movement operates there.

The Peruvian Context

Peruvian economic strategies and trade

In the 1970's and 1980's, the Peruvian external sector went through periods characterised predominantly by protectionist policies based on import substitution with high tariffs, wide tariff dispersion, quotas and prohibitions on imports, multiple exchange rates and various other anti-import mechanisms (Segura Vasi and García Carpio 2006, 330-1). The tariff structure favoured inputs and capital goods for local production. This system allowed non-export production to enjoy high levels of effective protection. In the early 1990's, an economic program was implemented that sought to reduce inflation, eliminate price controls and government intervention in economic activity, unify the currency system, and re-establish fiscal and monetary discipline (Segura Vasi and García Carpio 2006, 331). The Fujimori administration adopted a hands-off strategy and chose instead to assign the task of economic adjustment primarily to market forces (Wise 2003, 189).

In regards to trade policy, the level and range of tariffs were reduced and the primary tariff barriers and controls on current and capital accounts were eliminated. Moreover, the foreign exchange market was liberalised and efforts were made to attract foreign investment. Overall, these policies led to significant export growth during the 1990's, at an average per capita rate of 5.8 per cent during the first five years, and even higher rates in the second half of the decade, exceeding the Latin American average (Segura Vasi and García Carpio 2006, 331). Structural reforms included other measures that helped improve competitiveness in relation to the labour market (flexibility of hiring and firing practices), social security reform (creation of a private system based on individual investment accounts), tax reform, financial liberalisation with the elimination of interest rate controls, and the promotion of private investment. However after 1997, exogenous shocks, such as the international financial crisis and the El Niño phenomenon, affected negatively the external context and reduced the availability of resources for financing private activity, leading to a slowdown in the implementation of the reform programs (Segura Vasi and García Carpio 2006, 332).

The sources of GDP growth during the 1990's were primarily growth in investments and exports. During the period from 1990 to 1995, growth was explained mainly by investment, while from 1996 to 2000, it was explained mostly by exports (Segura Vasi and García Carpio 2006, 333). The downside of market transformation for Peru has been the worsening plight of the smaller producers and less skilled workers who have yet to reap the benefits of, or integrate into, international markets for investment and trade (Wise 2003, 243).

According to García (2007, 138) between 2002 and 2006, Peru experienced the most vigorous economic upswing of its recent history. Peruvian exports are largely characterised by primary and semi-processed products, mostly from the mining and fishing industries, which are subject to significant fluctuations in production volume and international market prices. Non-traditional products, especially manufactured goods, tend to represent a smaller percentage of foreign sales (Segura Vasi and García Carpio 2006, 336). However, the rapid expansion in the external demand for minerals and other extractive products added to the impact of the 2002 Andean Trade Promotion and Drug Eradication Act (ATPDEA) with the United States, which lowered tariff barriers and stimulated the dynamism and diversification of non-traditional exports (García 2007, 138).

In 2006, a large portion of the Peruvian populace felt they had not benefited from Peru's economic success after 2002 (García 2007, 138). The 2006 election demonstrated that 47 per cent of the electorate was willing to abandon the successful economic model and return to old populist practices. Some of the reasons given by García (2007, 138) are the unequal access to opportunities; the lag between economic growth, employment, and incomes; the concentration of exports in a relatively small number of firms; and the technological backwardness of the vast peasant economy in the Andean region.

In this way, President Alan García (1985-1990), and his predecessors Alberto Fujimori (1990-2000) and Alejandro Toledo (2001-2006), followed policies which Félix Jiménez describes in his article for *La Primera* on July 5th, 2009, as "neo-colonial modernisation." The current neo-colonial strategy follows the Washington Consensus that considers countries like Peru as fields for transnational investments. However, the policies implemented by the Peruvian government tend to exploit human capital and have reduced expenditures on health, education, and salaries. With this, under-employment has increased. Thus, Jiménez¹⁸ states that these strategies of development and growth have created a form of growth that does not create jobs or decent incomes, and that excludes the vast majority of Peru's population in the rural highlands and jungle areas. Correspondingly, Del Alamo (2010, 2-3) points out that despite the high rate of economic growth during the past years, the incidence of poverty reduction¹⁹ has been uneven. Poverty rates declined in urban areas between 2004 and 2007 from 37.1 per cent to 25.7 per cent, while in rural areas the rates were reduced only from 68.6 to 64.6 per cent. By geographical regions, the coastal area has benefitted from a poverty reduction of 36.1 to 22.6 per cent. In the highlands poverty reduction levels went from 64.7 to 60.1 per cent and in the jungle 57.7 to 48.4 per cent. Therefore, considering the exceptional economic conditions that Peru has enjoyed during the past decade, it is clear that not everyone has benefited from the economic growth and that disparities persist. After having examined the economic panorama, I will now review the agricultural and artisanal products in Peru in order to establish the basic conditions surrounding Fair Trade there.

Peruvian Agriculture and Agricultural Products

According to the National Institute of Statistics and Informatics, in 2006 agriculture represented 8.3 per cent of Peru's gross domestic product (GDP). Regarding the relevance of the agricultural sector to the national economy, it was calculated that a 31.6 per cent (8.1 million people) of the total population live from agricultural activities, and that the agricultural sector employed 31.2 per cent (2.8 million people) of the economically active population (EAP). In contrast to its ability to generate employment, this sector has low labour productivity due to low educational level of the workforce in the rural areas²⁰.

Moreover, the Peruvian Ministry of Agriculture claims that Peru is a country favoured by its climatic conditions, having 28 different climates and 84 life zones of the total 104 that exist

¹⁸ Félix Jiménez. 2009. El choque de dos concepciones de modernidad: Modernización Neocolonial y Modernización Democrática. *La Primera*, July 5th, <<http://www.diariolaprimeraperu.com/online/noticia.php?IDnoticia=41586>> (accessed July 2009).

¹⁹ The poverty line considers the total costs of all the essential resources. According to Instituto Nacional de Estadística e Informática (INEI), in 2007 the poverty line in Peru was set in 229.4 Soles per capita, per month. 1 US Dollar = 2.79 Peruvian Nuevos Soles in October 20th, 2010.

²⁰ Ministerio de Agricultura del Perú, Sector Agrario, Agrícola: <<http://www.minag.gob.pe/sector-agrario/agricola.html>> (accessed July 2009).

globally. This particularity is important, as it generates a biological diversity which is a natural source of comparative advantages. Peru has a diverse geographical structure that can be grouped in the three following regions: coast, mountain range or highlands, and jungle. Each region produces different products as detailed in the following (Schwartz 2004, 37):

- Coast: cotton, sugar cane, mangos, lemon, asparagus, grapes, strawberries, avocado, paprika, mandarins, oranges, olives, beans and more.
- Highlands: cereals, legumes, vegetables, root crops, natural colorants, and others.
- Jungle: coffee, cacao, oil palm, fruits, timber species such as cedar, mahogany, walnut, and others.

The rich variety of climates and agricultural products makes Peru a country full of agrarian possibilities.

According to the Peruvian Ministry of Agriculture, Peruvian agriculture constitutes an economy based on parcels of land, where 85 per cent of the farmers have plots of less than ten hectares. The splitting of the parcels into smallholdings and their wide dispersion limit the production efficiency while increasing transportation costs. The poverty situation of many of the Peruvian peasants and small farmers is explained by the inadequate utilisation and degradation of the productive base of natural resources, because of the application of productive systems that extract more than they produce. The Peruvian Ministry of Agriculture points out that in Peru there are several business structures related to agriculture, such as cooperatives, peasant communities, and small and medium producers. All of them have different rationales when making decisions. Furthermore, farming develops in different ways according to the various natural regions. The dispersed production, with actors who have different motivations, makes it difficult for the government to centralise the Peruvian agricultural sector.

The agricultural activities are characterised by disorganized production and by a consequent decrease in profitability and competitiveness. The post harvest and marketing processes are also disorganized: the lack of a road infrastructure and a system of wholesale markets impact the high commercialisation costs that affect the agrarian producers. A common characteristic of the agricultural internal market is the multiplicity of intermediaries. It is said by the Ministry of Agriculture that there are at least seven stages of intermediation:

1. Producers, who market a low volume of production, or are not really organized to market their products, and who deal with intermediaries organized in monopolies or oligopolies.
2. Gatherers or compilers, usually the local dealers or merchants.
3. Carriers, people who transport the produce.
4. Wholesalers, who specialise usually in one product.
5. Distributors, in charge of distributing the produce through retail channels.
6. Retailers, who tend to be widely scattered and operate in public or neighbourhood markets and streets. They have little bargaining power against wholesalers or distributors.
7. Consumers.

The Peruvian agricultural commercial system is marked by high costs, problems of scale, high losses, and lack of infrastructure (Peralta Izarra 2009, 27). All these factors make the system inefficient. An efficient marketing system is a key to promoting the formation of prices according to market forces. Peru participates in international trade as a small supplier of most products it exports, representing about 0.5 per cent of world agricultural trade²¹. The Peruvian traditional exports are basically three: coffee, cotton and sugar. Coffee is the most important

²¹ Ministerio de Agricultura del Perú, Sector Agrario, El Comercio Internacional: <<http://www.minag.gob.pe/vision-general/el-comercio-internacional.html>> (accessed July, 2009).

agricultural product and in the following section more details are given about coffee production and its current conditions in the Peruvian context.

Coffee: A Peruvian Flag Product

In the international market, Brazil and Vietnam alone represent 49 per cent of the world coffee production, but notwithstanding this, coffee is an essential product for the Peruvian national economy. Coffee has been pointed out as a “Flag Product”; this term seeks to highlight the image and improve the position of Peruvian coffee²². In Peru, coffee is the main agricultural product for export, and it has an enormous socio-economic influence. Around 62.5 per cent of the total coffee production belongs to producers with less than 10 hectares, and 30 per cent comes from producers with between 10 to 30 hectares. Only 7.5 per cent comes from producers with areas under cultivation of above 30 hectares. In Peru, the most important Arabica coffees types are Typical, Caturra, Bourbon and Pache, which are produced under shade and in environmentally friendly conditions²³.

Coffee plants adapt well to the upper parts of the Amazon jungle. The optimum temperature for coffee cultivation is 20 to 25 ° C but according to the Peruvian Ministry of Agriculture it can grow from 5 to 30 ° C. Coffee can grow from sea level to 2000 m above sea level, although the optimum is 600 to 1800 m. The areas for coffee cultivation in Peru go from 600 up to 2,700 m (Agrobanco 2007, 3-4). Thus, coffee is produced in 15 departments of Peru. In 2006, five of them represented 90 per cent of the total production. The departments were Junín with 32 per cent, Cajamarca with 19, San Martín with 15, Cuzco with 14 and Amazonas with 10 per cent. During the last few years, San Martín is the department that has increased its share of coffee production the most, going from 2.6 per cent of the total in 1990, up to 15 per cent in 2006²⁴. The Peruvian departments of San Martín and Huánuco significantly increased their planted areas because coffee serves as a legitimate alternative to illegal coca crops²⁵.

The Ministry of Agriculture indicated that in 2000 Peru had a total harvested area of 228,000 hectares, and that coffee yields were 15.1 quintals per hectare. In 2006, harvested areas rose to 313,282 hectares, increasing by 37.3 per cent, while yields produced 17.9 quintal per hectare, representing a growth of 18.9 per cent. In 2000, the total Peruvian production was 158,000 tons, while in 2006 it rose to 258,000 tons, increasing by 63.2 per cent. Hence, Peruvian coffee production is dominant in the whole agricultural sector.

Despite coffee’s importance, its patterns of commercialization do not vary greatly from the ones used for other agricultural products. A long chain of intermediaries is also seen in the coffee trade. Farmers grouped in cooperatives have been able to avoid intermediaries and traditional commercialization models, exporting directly and in this way obtaining better prices. International sales are made mostly by private exporters who buy the parchment coffee and process it in order to get green or golden coffee (ready to be roasted). In 2010 the most important

²² Comisión de Productos Bandera. COPROBA: Comisión de Productos Bandera. Prompex. <<http://www.prompex.gob.pe/prompex/Documents/perutrade/2005/01/72-74-articulo-coproba.pdf>> (accessed October 2009).

²³ Ministerio de Agricultura del Perú, Sector Agrario, Cultivos de Importancia Nacional, Café, Generalidades del Producto: <<http://www.minag.gob.pe/cafe/generalidades-del-producto/2.html>> (accessed July 2009).

²⁴ Ministerio de Agricultura del Perú, Sector Agrario, Cultivos de Importancia Nacional, Café, Producción: <<http://www.minag.gob.pe/cafe/produccion/4.html>> (accessed July 2009).

²⁵ The Peruvian Ministerio del Interior (Home Office) implemented eradication campaigns such as CORAH: Control y Reducción de la Hoja de Coca en el Alto Huallaga. See Naciones Unidas Oficina contra la Droga y el Delito (ONUDD), Perú: Monitoreo de Cultivos de Coca.

destination markets for Peruvian coffee were Germany, the United States, Belgium and Sweden²⁶. After this examination of agricultural products and especially coffee, the paper now proceeds to review Peruvian artisanal products and their situation.

Artisanal Products

Peru is a country with an unlimited number of local arts and craft products that originate in the various towns and communities of particular ethnic groups. The artisanal work of indigenous Peruvians is seen as a complementary activity to agriculture or grazing, and it is needed in order to compensate for the precariousness of their agriculture. Peruvian artisans produce mainly textiles, pottery, jewellery, wood carving, sculptures, leather articles, tapestries, etc (Mittiga 2004a, 26-7).

The complementarities between agriculture and artisanal production are evident; for example in the rainy season the farmers dedicate all their attention to the fields or herds, while in the dry season they devote themselves to craftsmanship. Therefore, it is through agriculture and crafts that the peasants-artisans maintain high levels of activity through the year. Moreover, the artisanal activities are the most accessible occupations for the peasant communities to supplement their agricultural economy, since the development of a handicraft production unit demands a quite low investment. Due to family traditions and cultural heritage, peasants do not have any problem in regards to craft techniques and knowledge. The artisanal activities depend on ecological, economical, and historical factors: the availability of materials, for example clay or wool, the maintenance or loss of a pre-colonial artisanal tradition, etc. These are factors that can explain partially why some communities turn to crafts and others do not, or why some opt for a specific kind of craftsmanship (Contreras 1982, 102).

Contreras (1982, 107) states that cash sales have replaced the traditional barter in craft products, and that sales through intermediaries have greatly increased. The intermediaries usually own commercial stalls in urban areas; however, the majority of them also represent export agencies. In this way, a mercantile economy has influenced the artisanal production that was born from local consumption needs. Artisanal products now have mainly an exchange value, which merchants and intermediaries mediate.

Regarding traditional exchange, the clientele of the peasant-artisans is now more diverse, from merchants from Lima to tourists. Nevertheless, the main commercialization channel is still through intermediaries, wholesalers, retailers, and artisanal shops that hire some artisans directly. In this way, most of the artisans work by request. Overall, the main beneficiaries of this commercial chain are the intermediaries, mostly because besides selling the artisanal products, intermediaries tend to be the suppliers of raw materials and give financial support to the artisans. Regardless of the increasing commercialisation of artisanal products, the living conditions of the peasant-artisans have not improved, apart from some exceptions (Contreras 1982, 109). The prices for basic subsistence products have increased, as well as the inputs for their crafts; however, the prices for their artisanal products have remained the same and are controlled by merchants and intermediaries (Contreras 1982, 110).

In this light, Fair Trade represents a propitious alternative. It eliminates several intermediaries in the commercial chain, thus providing benefits directly to the producers. Additionally, Fair Trade is likely to produce non-pecuniary benefits: the preservation of indigenous cultures and products is regarded as one of the most significant benefits of alternative trade since artisans were being forced to abandon the production of some items as they lost their

²⁶ Source: Superintendencia Nacional de Administración Tributaria (SUNAT).

use value, and they focused instead on goods with a higher rate of return. Several alternative trade shops operating in Peru have the stated goal of supporting the manufacture and export of traditional crafts (Leclair 2002, 956). After having established the proper context for Fair Trade in Peru, the following section examines Fair Trade operations, as well as the Peruvian certified producers in the South American context, and then reviews some of the organizations that support the Fair Trade movement.

Fair Trade in Peru

Fair Trade is a movement originated by Northern consumers in order to help Southern producers. In this way, the concept of Fair Trade has been developed and is mainly used by consumer from the global North. This explains why in Peru Fair Trade is a quite unknown concept, as are its principals, practices, and impacts. Economically, Fair Trade has a significant presence in the exports of coffee, handicrafts, bananas, cotton and other products²⁷. Food products of different categories have already obtained FLO-CERT's international certification as will be shown in the following pages. The following section reviews how Fair Trade has been developing and operating in Peru, a Fair Trade producer country.

Fair Trade Operations in Peru

Fair Trade became known to Peruvian organizations through contact with European markets. According to the answers obtained in interviews with the people in charge of promoting and leading organizations working in Fair Trade, intermediaries serve as transmitters of the Fair Trade concept²⁸. In other cases, Fair Trade became known through religious organizations and non-governmental organizations (NGOs). It was through these organizations that the clientele of Peruvian Fair Trade producers grew.

In the following pages, the focus turns to finding out the number of certified producers, organizations, and operators in Peru. This information will allow us to determine the importance of Peru in the South American context of Fair Trade producers and in the overall Fair Trade movement.

Certified Producers

In general, the Latin America region has a central role in certified Fair Trade production, due to the historical importance of its production of coffee, and more recently bananas, orange juice, and other items. The growth of FLO has been evident in Latin America, with the number of certified organizations rising from 185 in 2000 to 399 in 2005 (Wilkinson and Mascarenhas 2007, 127). There are currently 22 certified products exported from Latin America. The majority of the producers export coffee or bananas; however, there has been an increment of new products exported by producers, such as wine, fresh fruits, and nuts (Wilkinson and Mascarenhas 2007, 127).

The rising sales of certified products in mainstream markets have led to an increment of FLO affiliated commodity traders, which are increasing even faster than the number of producer organizations, with several of the many new traders oriented toward the conventional retail

²⁷ MINCETUR – Ministerio de Comercio Exterior y Turismo. Central Interregional de Artesanos del Perú. Ministerio de Comercio Exterior y Turismo.

<http://www.mincetur.gob.pe/turismo/comercio_justo_turismo/II_ENCUESTRO_COMERCIO_JUSTO_Y_TURISMO-TRUJILLO_PERU/EXPERIENCIAS%20NACIONALES/CIAP/CIAP-CJ07.pdf> (accessed December 2008).

²⁸ This information was obtained during the authors field work in Peru in 2009.

sector (Wilkinson and Mascarenhas 2007, 127). Currently, Peru produces a variety of handicrafts for the Fair Trade market along with a diversity of agricultural products. In the case of the agricultural products, FLO-CERT, as mentioned before, is the agent responsible for monitoring and certifying the compliance with established standards of producer groups, importers and exporters. Hence, FLO has standards for traders and producers. The traders are buyers, sellers, manufacturers, or transformers of certified Fair Trade products. Traders licensed by FLO must pay a fee for use of the Fair Trade label and must follow the following principles:

1. To buy from approved grower organizations using long term contracts.
2. To guarantee payments of the FLO minimum price (including a set premium for certified organic items).
3. To pay an additional social premium to be invested in community development.
4. To provide partial payment, upon request, at the time of purchase rather than waiting until the commodity is sold to retailers (Raynolds and Long 2007, 19).

Thus, traders as well as producers must comply with the regulations and standards dictated by FLO. According to the information obtained from FLO-CERT²⁹, there are a total of 83 certified operators, 74 producers and nine traders in Peru. The majority of them, 45 producers and four traders, relate to coffee, as it is the most important export oriented agricultural product. The next largest numbers of certified operators are for cocoa and bananas. Other certified producers are in the fields of fresh fruit, cotton, sugar, nut oil, juice and tea. The number of Peruvian certified producers is, in this way, more than 8 times higher than the number of traders.

In the South American region, Peru is the country that has the most, 74, producers certified by FLO-CERT, followed by Colombia with 63 producers. Ecuador is far behind with 26, followed by Brazil with 25 and Bolivia with 24. On the other hand, Brazil is the country with more certified traders, with 17, followed by Colombia with 14 and Ecuador with ten. The total number of certified operators in South America is of 306. Only two countries, Uruguay and Venezuela, have neither producers nor traders certified by FLO-CERT. The countries with lower numbers of certified traders are Argentina, Bolivia, Chile and Paraguay.

As previously mentioned, Colombia follows Peru regarding producer certification, with other countries far behind. This situation could be explained by the fact that Peru and Colombia are the main producers of Fair Trade certified coffee in the South American region, having both 45 and 35 operators in the coffee field respectively³⁰. Peru also leads in certified operators in cocoa, while Colombia leads in bananas.

Coffee has an important presence in Fair Trade certification, as it has more than a 100 producers certified in over five different countries. Furthermore, Peru is the country with the most certified producers of coffee and cocoa, and the only one with certified producers of cotton and tea in South America (figures date from April 2009). Colombia has the second largest number of certified producers; however they are concentrated mainly in the fields of coffee and bananas.

According to the information extracted from FLO-CERT's webpage, Peru offers nine different Fair Trade products: coffee, bananas, cocoa, fresh fruits, sugar, juice, nut oil seed, cotton and tea. The range of certified agricultural products that Peru offers is also the most diverse, followed only by Ecuador with seven products. Chile and Paraguay are the countries with the least diverse range of Fair Trade certified products. This situation gives Peru a

²⁹ The information regarding FLO-CERT operators was extracted from FLO-CERT, Certification for Development in April 15th, 2009. <<http://www.flo-cert.net/>>.

³⁰ Source: FLO-CERT, April 15th, 2009.

privileged position regarding Fair Trade negotiations. Overall, these factors should allow Peru to become a stronger player in the Fair Trade market.

Nevertheless, in the analysis of Fair Trade certified operators, the study also has to consider the handicraft field. As handicrafts, per se, have no certification, the WFTO is the entity that certifies organizations committed 100 per cent to Fair Trade. Thus, in order to find out the number of certified handicraft producers, the focus is on the number of members of the WFTO.

From the information found on the WFTO website, it can be said that Peru is again the country with the most WFTO member organizations in South America, having a total of eight. Brazil, Bolivia, and Ecuador have a total of six organizations each, followed by Chile, Argentina and Colombia with four, three and two, respectively. This indicates that Peru has more organizations committed to Fair Trade than any other country in the region. On the other hand, Venezuela and Uruguay are the only two countries that have no products certified by FLO-CERT, and in the case of handicrafts Venezuela also has no WFTO member organizations.

Organizations that support Fair Trade in Peru

Although, literature and statistical data concerning Fair Trade in Peru are limited, several organizations are working in Peru towards the Fair Trade objectives. As Jorge Loayza noted in his article for *La Republica* on February 15, 2009, Alfonso Cotera, the representative of the Red Peruana de Comercio Justo y Comercio Ético (Peruvian Network of Fair Trade and Ethical Consumption), indicates that there are 40,000 coffee producer families and 20,000 handicrafts producer families that have benefited from Fair Trade. Among the main organizations responsible for this improvement are Central Interregional de Artesanos del Perú (CIAP) and the Junta Nacional del Café (JNC). JNC represents Peruvian coffee producers while CIAP produces handicrafts following the Fair Trade principles. It should be mentioned that none of them are dedicated exclusively to promoting or supporting Fair Trade.

Further, in 2004, the Peruvian Network of Fair Trade and Ethical Consumption was established during the first National Forum of Fair Trade and Ethical Consumption. During the last five years it has been working toward four different goals:

1. Market development: promoting Fair Trade and “solidarity economy”³¹ shops and fairs throughout the country.
2. An accreditation/certification system: currently under development through dialogues between producers, promoters and consumers, it is expected that the accreditation will provide guarantees regarding quality and product standards and the Fair Trade organizations.
3. Political networking: opening dialogue and collaboration with public entities, especially local governments and the National Congress.
4. Organization and diffusion: integrating more producer and consumer organizations into the network and promoting the advantages of Fair Trade in the media.

The article ‘2,300 Peruanos ya viven mejor gracias al Comercio Justo’ in the magazine *Otro mundo es posible*³² noted that there are 20 points where Fair Trade products could be

³¹ Solidarity economy refers to the economic activities aimed at expressing practical solidarity with disadvantaged groups of people.

³² Otro mundo es posible. 2008. 2,300 Peruanos ya viven mejor gracias al Comercio Justo. *Otro mundo es posible*, year 4, no. 33 (March), <http://www.otromundoesposible.net/default.php?mod=magazine_detail&id=674> (accessed December 2008).

bought in Lima, four certified stores, and three Fair Trade fairs every week. It also indicates that in Peru, as well as in other South American countries, the sales of Fair Trade products are constantly growing. In the search for organizations that support Fair Trade in Peru, the author came across the Grupo Red de Economía Solidaria del Perú (GRESP), whose executive director is the representative for the Peruvian Network of Fair Trade and Ethical Consumption. In the following section a brief description of this organization is presented as well as the interview with its executive director.

Grupo Red de Economía Solidaria del Perú (GRESP)

GRESP could be translated as the “Net Group of Solidarity Economy of Peru.” GRESP was established in 1995 as a response to the impact of the western neo-liberal model on Peru. GRESP is a civil association which brings together non-governmental organizations, religious organizations, international cooperation entities based in Peru, and people committed to promoting cooperative practices in the economy³³. The solidarity economy movement emphasizes market participation, the development of solidarity-based production networks, and involvement in national and global policy initiatives supporting disadvantaged producers, workers, and consumers (Wilkinson and Mascarenhas 2007, 129).

The objectives of the net group are stated as follows³⁴:

- Procure the development of people and towns in an integrated way affirming the value of life, dignity, and respect for human rights.
- Search for human and nature harmony, building a peaceful, free and just environment for the happiness of men and women.
- Contribute to creating economic models that would contribute to eradicating poverty, unemployment and marginalization.
- Support economic initiatives in civil society, especially from young people, women, indigenous peoples and other excluded groups.
- Promote equal gender relations and the development of citizens.
- Establish a national and international level of economic solidarity.

GRESP envisages a society that produces in a fair, responsible and caring way goods and services suitable for the needs of individuals and communities, in harmony with the environment, distributed fairly, leading to a new pattern of human coexistence and integrated development. In an interview with the Executive Director of the group, he indicated that since the year 2000 GRESP has looked to expand the vision of Fair Trade. GRESP took the principles of Fair Trade and expanded them to include the development of the local market. The objective of this is to establish a Fair Trade system adapted to the Peruvian reality.

GRESP is also working towards developing an internal and local Fair Trade market. However, as stated by Wilkinson and Mascarenhas (2007, 133) the development of Southern markets faces the additional challenges of increasing consumer awareness, defining market strategies, developing market channels, and involving key private and public sector actors.

According to the information given by the director of GRESP, the local consumer turns to Fair Trade for the products, not because of the Fair Trade label. Currently the local consumer

³³ GRESP – Grupo Red de Economía Solidaria del Perú. <<http://www.gresp.org.pe/>> (accessed April 2009).

³⁴ GRESP – Grupo Red de Economía Solidaria del Perú, Objetivos: <http://gresp.org.pe/nos_objetivos.php> (accessed April 2009).

can access Fair Trade products only in fairs and shops. Although the local market pays a price that is slightly higher than the price for non-Fair Trade products, the quality of the Fair Trade products is also higher. And when compared with comparable high quality brands, the price could be considered low.

In Peru, the middle class is the group offering major support to the Fair Trade movement, specifically the upper-middle class. However, this situation is mainly explained by the location of the Fair Trade shops. According to the information given by the director of GRESP, less than 1% of the Peruvian population knows about Fair Trade or the concept behind it. As was stated previously, the national consumer buys Fair Trade only because of the products.

Regarding certification, FLO-CERT is the organization in charge of certifying all the Peruvian Fair Trade operators. Nevertheless, as explained by the GRESP Director, in Peru the producers who export are the only ones that are Fair Trade certified. In this regard, GRESP expects to create a national certification process for local producers. This certification will be at the national level, and will be adapted to the Peruvian socio-economic reality. According to Mittiga (2004b, 34), the creation of a Fair Trade national certification will add value to Peruvian products and create a national market for them. It will also simplify the process of obtaining FLO certification. In cases where producers already have FLO certification, the accreditation under the national certification will be automatic. In the case of Peruvian products that have not been certified by FLO, but where FLO has a certification system for them, as in the case of coffee, chocolate, cacao, fruits, juices, sugar, tea, honey or wine, the national certification will constitute a first step towards the FLO accreditation. The national certification will provide an increment in the value of the products based on their quality until they are certified by FLO. A third case is for the products which FLO does not certify. In these cases, establishing national criteria for certification constitutes the only possibility of certification for these products. The creation of specific standards could be done in collaboration with other Latin American initiatives or with FLO.

Most ATOs strive to eliminate middlemen whom they believe act as a financial drain on producer returns (Littrell and Dickson 1999, 181); conversely, the General Coordinator of the Peruvian Network of Fair Trade and Ethical Consumption argues that intermediaries are needed in order to export. In Peru's Fair Trade system, intermediaries are organizations that represent the producers or are related to NGO's or religious groups. Similarly, Clare Smith and Tom Aageson, from the North American ATO Aid to Artisans, cited in Littrell and Dickson (1999, 181), indicate that middlemen can be extremely valuable and very important if they are honest people, and go on to say that getting rid of middlemen depends on the situation because there is a valid need for what they do.

One of the organizations helping Fair Trade in Peru is the WFTO. In Peru, it works by opening up market opportunities for different products, but only in the international market. According to GRESP Director the WFTO is responsible for organizing events and fairs. In this regard, the WFTO's role is mainly to focus on marketing issues.

The Fair Trade movement has grown in Peru to include new members, such as networks of producer organizations, promotional institutes, and NGO's. Additionally, the Mesa de Coordinación Latinoamericana de Comercio Justo promotes the social and solidarity economies and seeks political support and the exchange of products in Latin America.

A key actor in the development of alternative markets in Southern countries is the state. As noted by Wilkinson and Mascarenhas (2007, 134), public policies are essential in dealing with deficiencies in technical assistance, credit, and capacity building for small producers. By

contrast, while being asked about support from the government, GRESP's director explained that there is a complete lack of interest from the government, and that the only support they received is from local governments that provide spaces for Fair Trade fairs or shops. At the time of the interview GRESP's director indicated that the President of the Commission of Production, Micro and Small Enterprises and Cooperatives of the Congress was studying the possibility of a law that would benefit the Fair Trade products sector.

Overall, Wilkinson and Mascarenhas (2007, 129) state that "collaboration between... different social movements and initiatives, despite their varied interests, organizations, and objectives, offers important opportunities for the consolidation of strategic alliances". The main social movements that have emerged in the South have the potential to influence and benefit from Fair Trade. Among these movements are those engaged with the solidarity economy (as in the case of GRESP), community trade, family farming, agro-ecology and organic agriculture, and ethical and responsible consumption advocacy (Wilkinson and Mascarenhas 2007, 129). The "potential synergies between these movements and Fair Trade...[could facilitate] the collaborative construction of further Southern initiatives for fairer markets and sustainable development" (Wilkinson and Mascarenhas 2007, 129). Furthermore, Barrientos and Dolan (2006, 183) argue that Southern initiatives provide the opportunity for greater local flexibility, and the rapid rise of supermarkets in the South represent an opportunity to expand Fair Trade consumption into the developing world.

Conclusion

Fair Trade is a development tool that aims to return more income to producers using existing capitalist supply chains, by improving free market mechanisms through non-market measures such as price floors (Nicholls and Opal 2005, 32). Fair Trade is a unique solution to market failures in the global trading system. As it is a consumer choice movement, it is outside the scope of government regulation. Furthermore, by correcting market failures to make the trading system work for everyone, Fair Trade is a neo-liberal solution that works in an efficient capitalist system, rather than abandoning the liberal trade model entirely (Nicholls and Opal 2005, 13).

The Fair Trade movement has been around since the end of the Second World War but only recently has it reached the mainstream. In Peru, the concept is still little known and only some organizations are working under Fair Trade standards. This article has presented an analytical panorama of Peru regarding economic and trade policies, agricultural and artisanal products, Fair Trade certified organizations and products, and the results of an interview with the Executive Director of a Peruvian organization that supports Fair Trade practices.

In summary, in recent years Peru has experienced high economic growth, and despite the progressive poverty reduction, the benefits have not had the same impact through the whole territory, excluding mainly the rural population from the highlands and jungle regions. Another major point of discussion in the Peruvian context is coffee, as it is one of the most important agricultural products of Peru and the most important Fair Trade commodity. In 2008, Peru was the eighth biggest coffee producer in the world³⁵. Peru presents advantageous conditions for the cultivation of special coffees and this fact, added to coffee's rising demand, represents a promising opportunity that should not be overlooked. Despite the socio-economic importance of coffee and artisanal products, the traditional commercial system for both still includes a long

³⁵ Source: International Coffee Organization (ICO).

chain of intermediaries, and Fair Trade represents a way of bypassing that chain.

The Latin American region has a major role in Fair Trade production, and Peru has a significant presence in Fair Trade with coffee, handcrafts, and bananas exports. In South America, Peru is the country with most producers certified by FLO-CERT (the highest percentage of them related to coffee), as well as the country with the most diversified offerings of Fair Trade products. Peru also represents the country with the largest number of producer organizations which are members of the WFTO, and this means it has the highest number of organizations 100 per cent committed to Fair Trade. Among the organizations that support Fair Trade in Peru is GRESP, a group supporting the solidarity economy, which works to develop the internal Fair Trade market and has the future goal of establishing a Fair Trade system adjusted to the Peruvian socio-economic reality. Furthermore, it is expected that the Peruvian government will give its support through future policies and regulations.

Future Perspectives

The following are some considerations that should be acknowledged when approaching Fair Trade in Peru.

- Because of its diversified offerings of Fair Trade products, Peru could become an even stronger player in the global Fair Trade market.
- Given that coffee has such a national importance, the government should support the improvement of its production by establishing institutions in the major producer areas of Peru that offer technical and financial assistance. The importance of stimulating the cultivation of coffee as an alternative to coca crops should also be considered.
- Asia is a raising market, especially for specialty coffees, and both of these factors represent a favorable opportunity for high quality Peruvian coffee producers.
- Fair Trade products should be promoted in areas of Peru with large middle class populations, for example in some residential zones of Lima. Links could be established between the major department stores and artisanal Fair Trade producers with the objective of giving improved access to the national market to producers who are often marginalised. In the same way, exclusive supermarkets could also offer Fair Trade products to the national consumers.

Acknowledgments: I would like to thank the Executive Director of the Grupo Red de Economía Solidaría del Perú, Mr. Cotera. Thanks also to Professor Jeremy Eades for his comments on an earlier version of this paper.

References:

Agrobanco

2007 *Área de Desarrollo: Cultivo del Café.*

http://www.agrobanco.com.pe/cultivo_del_cafe.pdf (accessed October 2009).

Barrientos, Stephanie and Catherine Dolan

2006 "Concluding Reflections on the Future of Ethical Sourcing". In *Ethical Sourcing in the Global Food System*, ed. Stephanie Barrientos and Catherine Dolan, 179-186. London: Eathscan.

- Barratt Brown, Michael
 1993 *Fair Trade: Reform and Realities in the International Trading System*. New Jersey: Zed Books Ltd.
- Contreras, Jesús
 1982 La Producción Artesanal en los Andes Peruanos: Del Valor de Uso al Valor de Cambio. *Boletín Americanista*, N° 32: 101-114.
<http://www.raco.cat/index.php/BoletinAmericanista/article/view/98419/164478>
 (accessed October 2009).
- Del Alamo, Oscar
 2010 Crecimiento con Desigualdad en el Perú: Un Escenario de Conflictos. *Argumentos*, Instituto de Estudios Peruanos, Year 4, N° 1: 1-7.
- García, Norberto E.
 2007 A boom in a Heterogeneous economy: Peru 2002-2006. *CEPAL Review*, N° 93: 137-148. <http://web.ebscohost.com/ehost/pdf?vid=7&hid=106&sid=f147dfb3-7abd-4c3a-9568-c4c02a7eb1db%40sessionmgr112> (accessed October 2009).
- Hutchens, Anna
 2009 *Changing Big Business: The Globalization of the Fair Trade Movement*. Glos: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited.
- Leclair, Mark S.
 2002 Fighting the Tide: Alternative Trade Organizations in the Era of Global Free Trade. *World Development* Vol. 30, N° 6: 949-958. <http://www.sciencedirect.com/> (accessed November 2009).
- Littrell, Mary Ann, and Marsha Ann Dickson
 1999 *Social Responsibility in the Global Market: Fair Trade of Cultural Products*. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Luetchford, Peter
 2008 *Fair Trade and a Global Commodity: Coffee in Costa Rica*. London: Pluto Press.
- Micheletti, Michele
 2003 *Political Virtue and Shopping: Individuals, Consumerism, and Collective Action*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Mittiga, Stefania
 2004a Análisis del Impacto del Comercio Justo en el Sector Artesanía en el Perú. Paper presented at the Primer Foro Nacional de Comercio Justo y Consumo Ético, October 28-29, in Lima, Peru.
 2004b Hacia una Certificación Nacional de Comercio Justo. Paper presented at the Primer Foro Nacional de Comercio Justo y Consumo Ético, October 28-29, in Lima, Peru.
- Moore, Geoff
 2004 The Fair Trade Movement: Parameters, Issues and Future Research. *Journal of Business Ethics* 53: 73-86.
- Murray, Douglas L., and Laura T. Raynolds
 2007 “Globalization and its Antinomies”: Negotiating a Fair Trade Movement. In *Fair Trade: The Challenges of Transforming Globalization*, ed. Laura T. Raynolds, Douglas L. Murray and John Wilkinson, 3-14. Oxon: Routledge.
- Nicholls, Alex and Charlotte Opal
 2005 *Fair Trade: Market-Driven Ethical Consumption*. London: Sage Publications Ltd.

- Nielson, Julia.
 2006 “Aid for Trade”. In *Trade, Doha, and Development: A Window into the Issues*, ed. Richard Newfarmer, 319-328. Washington: The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / The World Bank.
- Peralta Izarra, Pelayo
 2009 Las Políticas Agrarias en el Perú. *Agro Enfoque*, Vol. 22, Issue 162: 24-30.
- Raynolds, Laura T., and Michael A. Long
 2007 “Fair / Alternative Trade”: Historical and Empirical Dimensions. In *Fair Trade: The Challenges of Transforming Globalization*, ed. Laura T. Raynolds, Douglas L. Murray and John Wilkinson, 15-32. Oxon: Routledge.
- Schwartz, Enrique
 2004 *Estudio de Tendencias y Perspectivas del Sector Forestal en América Latina Documento de Trabajo: Informe Nacional Perú*. Instituto Nacional de Recursos Naturales. Roma: Organización de las Naciones Unidas para la Agricultura y la Alimentación.
- Segura Vasi, Alonso and Juan García Carpio
 2006 “Peru- impact analysis of trade liberalisation on poverty and inequality.” In *Who gains from Free Trade? Export-led growth, inequality and poverty in Latin America*, ed. Ros Vos, Enrique Ganuza, Samuel Morley and Sherman Robinson, 329-360. Oxon: Routledge.
- Stiglitz, Joseph and Andrew Charlton
 2005 *Fair Trade for All*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Wilkinson, John and Gilberto Mascarenhas
 2007 “Southern Social Movements and Fair Trade”. In *Fair Trade: The Challenges of Transforming Globalization*, ed. Laura T. Raynolds, Douglas L. Murray and John Wilkinson, 125-137. Oxon: Routledge.
- Wise, Carol
 2003 *Reinventing the State: Economic Strategy and Institutional Change in Peru*. Michigan: University of Michigan Press.